

Local Understandings of Modernity: Food and Food Security on Mafia Island, Tanzania

**Report presented to
The Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology (COSTECH)
On fieldwork carried out June-August 2002
Mafia Island, Tanzania**

**By Pat Caplan
Professor of Anthropology
Goldsmiths College, University of London**

**Lewisham Way, London SE14 6NW, UK
Tel. (44) 207-919-7800
Fax (44) 207-919-7813
Email p.caplan@gold.ac.uk
Website www.gold.ac.uk/anthropology/**

Contents

Map of Tanzanian coast show location of Mafia
Map of Mafia showing villages and boundaries of Marine Park

List of tables	3
Preface and Acknowledgements	4
Executive Summary – English	5
Executive Summary – Swahili	7
1.0. Introduction	9
1.1. Rationale	
1.2. Theoretical and Conceptual Issues	
1.3. 'Hard times'	
2.0. Background: Mafia Island	11
2.1. Previous Research on Mafia	
2.2. Current state and development	
2.3. Education and health	
3.0. Research Methods	13
3.1. Interviews	
3.2. Participant observation	
3.3. Surveys	
3.4. Local records	
3.5. National archives	
3.6. Video and Photographs	
4.0. Kanga Village	16
4.1. Changes since 1994	
4.2. Health	
4.3. Education	
5.0. Food and Food Security in the village	21
5.1. Subsistence Crops	
5.2. Cash crops	
5.3. Bought food	
5.4. Views on imported food	
6.0. Making a living in the village	24
6.1 Fishing	
6.2. Keeping cattle	
6.3. Local employment	
6.4. Discussion: the shortage of cash	
7.0. Kilindoni: the District Capital	28
7.1. Interviews with government officials	
7.1.1. Problems experienced by officials	

7.1.2. How they see Mafia	
7.1.3. Officials' proposed solutions to the problems of Mafia	
7.2. The District Hospital, HIV and AIDS	
7.3. NGOs	
7.3.1. Chamama	
7.3.2. MICAS	
7.3.3. Kimama	
7.3.4. Tasisi ya Dini	
7.4. Discussion and Summary	
8.0. Tourist Developments on Mafia	36
8.1. Mafia Island Lodge	
8.2. Kinasi Lodge	
8.3. Pole Pole Bungalow Resort	
8.4. Chole Mjini Hotel	
8.5. Lixu Hotel	
8.6. Harbour View Hotel	
8.7. What do hotels contribute to the local economy?	
8.8. Projected hotel developments in Kanga village	
8.9. Discussion and Summary	
9.0. Fishing and Prawn Farming	45
9.1. Mafia Island Marine Park	
9.1.1. MIMP: the views of the staff	
9.1.2. MIMP: the views of local people	
9.2. Fish processing	
9.2.1. The views of management	
9.2.1. The views of fishermen	
9.3. Prawn farming	
9.3.1. The company's views	
9.3.2. The views of government officials	
9.3.3. The views of the District Council and of NGOs	
9.3.4. The views of local villagers	
9.3.5. The Consultants' views	
9.4. Summary and Conclusion	
10.0. Risk and danger: local views	56
10.1. Food security	
10.2. Illness	
10.3. Exclusion from development	
10.4. Loss of existing rights	
10.5. Discussion and Summary	
11.0. Trust and Blame: the view from below	58
11.1. The responsibility of government	
11.2. Political parties	
11.3. NGOs and vikundi	
11.4. Households, families and kin	
11.5. Blaming Swahili Culture	
11.6. Depending on oneself	

11.7. Depending on God	
11.8. Discussion and Summary	
13.0. Dissemination, follow-up and reciprocity	70
13.1. Dissemination of findings	
13.2. Assistance to Mafia people	
13.0. Policy Implications and Recommendations	71
13.1. Making use of existing information on Mafia	
13.2. Improvement of infrastructure	
13.3. Alleviation of poverty	
13.4. Improvement of education	
13.5. Improvement of health, including AIDS prevention	
13.6. Improvement of relations between government servants and Mafians	
13.7. Policy towards investment and development projects	
13.0. Mapendekezo na Uchangiaji wa Sera	75
Bibliography and References:	79
1. Mafia Island	
2. Other references	
Appendix One: Original Application	83
Appendix Two: Interviews Conducted	86
Appendix Three: Staff at the District Hospital	88
Appendix Four: Details of Video	88

List of Tables

1. Food Production and Demand on Mafia Island, 1996-2002
2. Prices of Food Sold in Shops in Kanga village and Kilindoni
3. Occupations of Kanga migrants to Dar es Salaam
4. Incidence of HIV/AIDS on Mafia

Preface and Acknowledgements

It has been my privilege to have had the opportunity to visit Tanzania regularly since 1962, and I have carried out fieldwork on Mafia Island in 1965-7, 1976, 1985, and 1994. My trip in 2002 thus marked forty years of acquaintance with the country and was my fifth research visit.

I am grateful to the Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology for permission to carry out the research. I must also thank both the Leverhulme Foundation, which gave me a Fellowship for the academic year 2001-2 enabling me to write and carry out fieldwork, and the Nuffield Foundation, which funded the fieldwork.

Numerous people helped me in a variety of ways but first and foremost I must thank my research assistant, the late Mikidadi Juma Kichange, who had been a friend since the 1960s. His sudden death in November 2002 was a great loss to his family, his natal village Kanga, the island of Mafia, and Tanzania as a whole. During the three months that we worked together in the summer of 2002, Mikidadi Juma assisted in numerous ways such as arranging interviews, carrying out surveys and dealing with many practical matters. Most importantly, he was a colleague with whom to discuss the work being carried out, providing a listening and critical ear.

Colleagues at the University of Dar es Salaam were friendly and welcoming, and I should particularly thank Professor Marjorie Mbilinyi, who was my Tanzanian counterpart, and from whose writings I have learned much. I am also grateful to Dr. Simeon Mesaki, who has himself carried out some research on Mafia and who was kind enough to read a draft of this report and comment on it. I am also grateful to the Mafia Island District Commissioner, Mr. Alli Libaba, for his interest in the project, for his hospitality, and his assistance, especially with transport. Mr. Gwakiray (DED) facilitated my introduction to other heads of government departments in the District Capital and himself granted me several interviews. Mr. Ahmed Mgeni and his wife Dr. Naomi Khatibu generously allowed me to use their house as a base when I was working in Kilindoni. Hospitality was also received from Catherine Muir and Jason Ruben of the WWF, Katia Palazzo and Marcello Lancellotti of Polepole Bungalow Resort, and Jem and Brenda Riggall of Ng'ombeni. Cecilia Mushobozi's flat in Dar es Salaam provided a home from home and good company. All of these people also spent a lot of time discussing current issues with me.

Ahmed Kipacha, lecturer at the Open University in Tanzania, and a Ph.D. linguistics student at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, has also carried out research in the north of Mafia. I thank him for reading this report and translating the Executive Summary and the Policy Implications and Recommendations into Swahili.

PC July 2003

Executive Summary in English

This report considers research carried out on Mafia Island, Tanzania, in June and July 2002. It is a continuation of research which the author has been conducting on the island since 1965.

The aims of the present research were as follows:

- To establish local views of general processes of modernity and development on Mafia Island, Tanzania
- To consider in particular whether food security is improving or not
- To establish the reasons for this situation
- To understand local interpretations of it

The Report begins with an introduction discussing the significance of local understandings of modernity, and some background information on Mafia Island. This is followed by a discussion of research methods adopted.

The research was carried out in the north of the island, especially the village of Kanga, in the District Capital, Kilindoni, and the tourist areas of Utende and Chole Island. The methods adopted were interviews, participant observations and surveys, and both local records and national archives were consulted. Assistance, especially with regard to surveys, was given by the late Mr. Mikidadi Juma Kichange.

Sections 4-6 focus upon Kanga village, considering the changes which have taken place in recent years. Positive changes, particularly in health facilities and education, are the subject of section 4, but sections 5 and 6 reveal that most people are experiencing a great increase in poverty, largely because of the drop in price of their main cash crop, coconuts. Other ways of making a living, such as fishing, trading and keeping cattle, cannot compensate for this, although younger men who fish for lobsters are better off than most. The general shortage of cash has led to a deterioration in the food security situation.

Section 7 looks at the District Capital, Kilindoni, examining the work of government officials, their views on Mafia, and proposed solutions to its problems, which include the development of tourism and the fishing industry. There is a separate section on the District Hospital, with some information about AIDS. This section also considers the role of four local NGOs.

In the next section, there is a consideration of the significance to the economy of the existing tourist hotels on the island – three in Utende and one on Chole Mjini. It is shown that they contribute to the local economy and to development in very varying degrees ranging from scarcely at all to important assistance. The second half of this section considers proposals to build two hotels in Kanga, and the responses of local people.

Section 9 considers the fishing industry on Mafia, first by discussing briefly the aims of the Marine Park and some local responses to this, then of the fish processing factory in Kilindoni, with a discussion of the views of management and local fishermen. The second half of this chapter focuses on the proposal to

set up a pilot prawn farm on Mafia Island, and examines the attitudes of the developers, government officials, the District Councils, local NGOs, local villagers and a team of expert consultants sent to evaluate the project.

Sections 10 and 11 attempt to extract a number of themes from the foregoing. The first is local views of risk and danger: what are the most important problems for villagers on Mafia? These are shown to be first and foremost food security, with some people finding it very difficult either to grow or purchase sufficient food. Secondly, people are concerned about illness and its attendant expenses, and especially the threat of HIV/AIDS. A third issue raised by many villagers was their feeling that Mafia is excluded from development. It is seen as a particularly backward and poor area of the country, and developments which do take place, such as the building of tourist hotels or the setting up of a fishing factory, do not benefit ordinary people. Indeed, the fourth issue raised is concerns about the loss of existing rights, including rights to land, beaches and fishing grounds, and the fear that developments such as prawn farming could lead to environmental degradation.

In Section 11, there is an examination of local views about who is responsible for all of the above. Most villagers attribute primary responsibility to 'the government', although they sometimes make distinctions between government at the village, district and national levels. Many argue that, while the village level of government is accountable and responsible, higher up, it becomes not only more difficult to get their voices heard and participate in decision-making, but that only those with means can achieve their ends, since corruption is felt to be endemic at these levels. They also feel that power in the district is mainly in the hands of non-Mafians, outsiders who do not understand or respect local culture.

Further, although people are aware of the existence of a number of political parties, there is a tendency to conflate government with the ruling party.

The argument that civil society should be developed in the form of NGOs and cooperative groups is one that people have heard many times, but they mostly remain unconvinced that such groups can solve their problems, given their paucity of means.

Many people spoke feelingly of their sense that even institutions or 'social capital' on which they could previously depend – households, family and fellow villagers – could no longer provide the support which they once did and that this arose from the poverty which forced people to look out for themselves, rather than others. Some attributed their current difficult situation to 'the work of God' and the evils of the time, which rendered them powerless to do much to change things.

Muhtasari wa Maazimio

Ripoti hii inahusu utafiti uliofanyika katika kisiwa cha Mafia, nchini Tanzania, mnamo mwezi Juni hadi Julai 2002. Ni sehemu ya maendeleo ya tafiti mbalimbali zilizofanywa na mwandishi kisiwani hapo tangu 1965. Madhumuni ya utafiti huu ni kama ifuatavyo:

- Kuonyesha ni kwa namna gani wananchi wanavyozichukulia dhana za usasa na maendeleo kisiwani Mafia nchini Tanzania.
- Kupima iwapo kuwa hali ya kujitolesheza kwa chakula inaimarika au kudidimia
- Kuonyesha sababu zinazopelekea kuwepo kwa hali hiyo
- Kutathmini mawazo ya wananchi juu ya hali hiyo

Ripoti imeanza na utangulizi unaojadili umuhimu wa jinsi wananchi wanavyolichukulia suala la usasa, na historia fupi ya kisiwa cha Mafia. Hii imefuatiwa na mbinu za utafiti zilizotumika. Utafiti huu umefanyika katika upande wa kaskazini wa kisiwa cha Mafia, hususani katika kijiji cha Kanga, vilevile mjini Kilindoni, na sehemu zenye vivutio vya utalii vya Utende na Chole kisiwani. Mbinu za utafiti zilizotumika ni kama vile: mahojiano ya ana kwa ana, aina mbalimbali za uchunguzi, na uchunguzi wa nyaraka. Marehemu Bwana Mikidadi Juma Kichange, kama mtafiti msaidizi, alitoa msaada mkubwa katika uchunguzi wa jumla.

Sehemu ya 4-6 imeshungulika zaidi na maendeleo yaliyojitokeza miaka ya karibuni katika kijiji cha Kanga. Sehemu ya 4 imejadili zaidi Maendeleo ya kutia moyo haswa katika upande wa huduma za afya na elimu, lakini sehemu ya 5 na 6 imeonyesha ni jinsi gani wananchi wanavyoathirika na umasikini haswa kutokana na kuanguka kwa bei ya zao kuu pekee la biashara (nazi). Njia nyenginezo za kujiongezea kipato kama vile uvuvi, biashara, na ufugaji vimeshindwa kuziba pengo la uhaba wa fedha ingawa inaonekana kuwa baadhi ya vijana wanaojishughulisha na uchokoaji wa kamba wanapata mapato ya kuridhisha kidogo. Uhaba wa fedha kwa ujumla unapelekea kuwa na upungufu wa uwezo wa kujitosheleza kwa chakula.

Sehemu ya 7 inajihusisha na utafiti uliofanyika katika Makao makuu ya wilaya, Kilindoni, haswa kwa kuangalia utendaji kazi wa maafisa wa serikali, mawazo yao kuhusu maendeleo ya Mafia na mchango wao katika kutatua matatizo yanayoikabili wilaya ya Mafia pamoja na kuendeleza sekta ya utalii na uvuvi kisiwani hapo. Suala la huduma za hospitali ya wilaya pamoja na ugonjwa wa ukimwi, limewekwa katika sehemu yake pekee. Sehemu hii vilevile imeshughulikia kazi za vyama vinne vya hiari (NGO).

Katika sehemu nyengineo inayofuatia, imejishughulisha na mchango wa hoteli za kitalii: tatu ya hizo zipo Utende na moja ipo Chole Mjini, katika kuinua uchumi. Utafiti umeonyesha kwamba mahoteli hayo yanachangia katika kuinua uchumi wa ndani na ustawi wa wenyeji katika viwango vinavyotofautiana kuanzia kusaidia kiasi hadi kusaidia kwa kiasi kikubwa. Upande mwingine wa sehemu hii inahusu mapendekezo ya kujengwa kwa hoteli mbili huko Kanga na mawazo ya wenyeji kuhusiana na mipango hiyo.

Sehemu ya 9 inajihusisha na miradi ya uvuvi kisiwani Mafia, kwa kuangalia kwanza,

madhumuni ya kuwepo kwa hifadhi bahari na mawazo ya wenyeji kuhusiana na kuwepo kwake. Pili, kuangalia kiwanda cha kusindika samaki kilichopo Kilindoni kwa kuzingatia zaidi mawazo ya viongozi sehemu ya utawala na yale ya wavuvi wenyeji. Sehemu ya pili ya sura hii inazingatia mapendekezo ya mradi wa ufugaji wa kamba kisiwani Mafia, na kuangalia jinsi wawekezaji, maafisa wa serikali, madiwani, vyama hiari, wanavijiji na jopo la wataalamu waliotumwa kutathmini mradi huo wanavyouchukulia mradi huo kwa ujumla.

Sehemu ya 10 na 11 imejaribu kuibua mafunzo tuliyoyapata katika hayo tuliyazungumzia hadi sasa. Kwanza kabisa, mtazamo wa wenyeji kuhusiana na shida na hatari mbalimbali zinazowakabili. Je? ni jambo lipila hatari zaidi linalotishia wanavijiji kisiwani Mafia. Kwanza imejionyesha kuwa utoshelevu wa chakula ni jambo linalowatatiza wananchi zaidi hasa ukichukulia kuwa baadhi ya watu inakuwa vigumu kwao kuweza kulima au kuweza kununua chakula cha kujitosheleza. Pili, watu wanahatarishwa na magonjwa na gharama za juu za matibabu, na zaidi mlipuko wa ugonjwa wa ukimwi. Jambo la tatu ni fikara za wenyeji kwamba Mafia imesahauliwa kimaendeleo. Wamafia wanajihesabu masikini na wapo nyuma kimaendeleo ukilinganisha na sehemu nyenginezo za nchi nzima. Kwa mtazamo wao hatua za ujengaji mahoteli ya kitalii na uanzishwaji wa viwanda vya kusindika samaki havina faida ya moja kwa moja kwa wenyeji wa Mafia. Suala la nne linahusu kupotea kwa haki miliki na uhuru wa wenyeji kumiliki ardhi na maeneo ya pwani, mabwawa ya samaki, na hofu kwamba ufugaji kamba utasababisha uharibifu wa mazingira kwa ujumla.

Katika sehemu 11, utafiti unajaribu kuangalia maoni ya wenyeji juu ya nani haswa anastahiki kubebeshwa lawama kwa hayo yaliyojitokeza hapo juu. Wengi wa wanavijiji wanaibebesha lawama serikali yenye jukumu la kuangalia yote hayo. Hata hivyo wanapozungumzia serikali, wanajaribu kutenganisha serikali katika ngazi zake mbalimbali kuanzia kama vile serikali za vijiji, wilaya na taifa. Wengi wanadai kuwa wakati ni dhima na wajibu wa serikali za vijiji kuwajibika, bado kuna ugumu kwa wananchi waliowengi kutoa mawazo yao na pia kushiriki katika kuamua mustakbala wao isipokuwa kwa wale wenye uwezo na sauti pekee. Hii inatokana na rushwa kuota mizizi katika ngazi hizo. Vilevile wanachukulia kwamba madaraka ya uongozi katika ngazi ya wilaya yameshikwa na wasio-wazawa wa Mafia ambao wanaotoka nje ya kisiwa chao na wenye kushindwa kuheshimu ada na desturi za wenyeji.

Zaidi ya hayo yaliyojitokeza, ingawaje watu wanauielewa fika mfumo wa vyama vingi, lakini wengi wanachukulia kuwa chama tawala na serikali ni sawa na chombo kimoja. Hoja kwamba maendeleo ya jamii yatapatikana kupitia vyombo hiari (NGO) na vikundi vya ushirika ni mawazo yanayosikika sana lakini wengi hawashawishiki kuwa vyombo hivyo vinaweza kutatua matatizo yao kutokana na uduni wa vitendea kazi na miundo mbinu.

Kwa sasa wananchi wengi wanazungumzia kuanguka kwa vyombo walivyokuwa wakivitegemea na kuvikimbilia wakati wa shida kama vile ukoo, familia, na wanavijiji wenziwao, na matokeo yake kwa sasa kila mtu anaangalia upande wake. Wengine wanachukulia hali hii kuwa ni 'kazi ya Mungu' na 'majaribu ya dunia' hivyo kuwadunisha na kuwafanya washindwe kujiletea maendeleo yao wenyewe, lakini wengi zaidi walisema kwamba mambo hayo ni shauri ya kuzidiwa na umaskini.

1. Introduction to this research project

1.1. Rationale

In Tanzania, as elsewhere, people are confronted with changes which are having profound repercussions on their lives: many feel themselves to be living in a 'runaway' world. Yet in order to act in this world, they have to try to make sense of it and to find explanations for what is happening. The anthropological study of 'local' or 'indigenous' knowledge has recently burgeoned and indeed has attracted the attention of many outside of the discipline. However the present research set out to consider local understandings of global processes and what is sometimes glossed as 'modernity', a shorthand for an enormous range of issues from the spread of global capitalism to technological change.

In order to find a way through this complexity, I proposed to use food as the major, although not the sole, vehicle for seeking local understandings of such issues since it carries a rich symbolic load and is also an important means of expressing social relations. In the context of modernity, the study of food also involves consideration of risk, trust, and doubt; of morality and entitlements; views of progress and the future as well as memory, nostalgia and the past; and the perceived dichotomy between lay and expert systems of knowledge. During the course of this work, it rapidly became apparent that an understanding of food and food security necessitated the consideration of a wide variety of issues. These included the cash economy and changes in the means of generating cash, and recent developments such as large-scale fishing and prawn farming, and tourist hotels.

Food and food security are also intimately linked to health issues, as my earlier research (Caplan 1995a, 1995c, 1995d, 1999) has shown. While, as will be seen, there has been improvement in some health issues, that of HIV-AIDS has not yet begun to be tackled seriously.

1.2 Theoretical and conceptual background

Social science is not lacking in theories of modernisation, notably by sociologists. But their work rarely engages with the local, and even more rarely with societies outside of the confines of the West, even though such theories are often presented as applying universally. The programme of research undertaken here seeks to marry theoretical debates on modernisation with ethnographic data from a location in which I have been working for over three decades, Mafia Island, Tanzania. The umbrella term 'modernisation' includes a wide variety of processes: industrialisation, capitalism, compression of time and space, science and new bio-technologies, the advance in communication technologies, intensification of change, disembedding of social institutions, growth in reflexivity, changes in consumption, demographic shifts (including migration), production of ecological hazards and risks. Yet Mafia Island is widely viewed as a backwater, remote and underdeveloped even by the standards of Tanzania, itself one of the poorest countries on the globe. This does not mean, however, that the islanders

are unaffected by or unaware of wider global processes and a major aim of the research was to seek to discover what such global processes mean at the local level and how people understand and respond to them.

The focus was upon food as a dominant vehicle of and metaphor for modernity. The study of food involves various domains of anthropology: symbolic, economic and political. It also relates to public understandings of science and technology, to concepts of rationality, risk and responsibility, to lay or indigenous forms of knowledge and to notions of identity. The aims were a) to consider the extent to which change is perceived to be accelerating and in what areas b) to elicit people's explanations for such changes as well as their views on where they and their communities are heading in future. It sought to build upon my recent work on food and risk¹ as well as upon earlier work, including collaborative, dialogic work on personal narratives (Caplan 1997a).

1.3. 'Hard times' (maisha magumu): local understandings of the impact of recent global processes on food security and insecurity on Mafia Island, Tanzania.

Since my previous visit in 1994, Tanzania has continued to struggle with economic problems (including the burden of debt and the implications of structural adjustment programmes), with resultant cutbacks in welfare provision and exacerbation of problems of food security.

The effects of all of these changes required to be assessed at the local, as well as the national level. Mafia Island, which has a long history of food security problems, had been badly affected and it appeared from letters received that for most villagers the quality of life, already deteriorating at the time of my fieldwork in 1985 and 1994, had declined still further (Caplan 2003). How did people interpret this situation? Where did they place responsibility for it? What strategies did they adopt to cope, and what view did they have of the future? Was the major risk indeed perceived to be food security, or were there other issues (such as the growing menace of AIDS)?

Building upon work already carried out, further data was sought on people's own conceptualisations of processes beyond the local. Who are considered to be the decision-makers around issues such as food production and consumption, sale of cash crops, and bought food and its prices, and on what basis are decisions made? How much room for manoeuvre – agency - do villagers themselves have? How do they interpret the dramatic changes in official rhetoric and policy from the days of *ujamaa* ('African socialism') to the current emphasis on neo-liberalism? How do views and explanations differ by social location, particularly age and gender? Some answers to such questions will appear in the remainder of this Report.

¹ Caplan (ed.) 1997 *Food, Health and Identity: Approaches from the Social Sciences* London and New York, Routledge; 2000 *Risk Revisited* (ed.) Pluto Press. London and Sterling, Virginia

In short, then, the aims were, as stated on the application form to COSTECH:

To establish local views of general processes of modernity and development on Mafia Island, Tanzania; to consider in particular whether food security is improving or not, the reasons for this situation, and local interpretations of it.

2.0. Background: Mafia Island.

2.1. The literature on Mafia Island

The number of publications on Mafia Island is quite limited. There is some historical material (Bauman 1896, King 1917, Revington 1936, Piggott 1941, Chittick 1961), and the Mafia District book, held at the National Archives in Dar es Salaam, has short pieces on land tenure, history, population etc.

In my own previous research I focused upon a variety of topics: kinship descent and land tenure (1965-7), gender relations and local-state relations (1976), food, health and fertility (1985, 1994), spirit possession and personal narratives (1994).

In recent years, three other anthropologists have also carried out research on Mafia: the Italian Katia Palazzo wrote an M.Phil. thesis on development focusing on the Utende area of the island (Palazzo 1999), while the American Christine Walley studied the effects of the setting up of the Mafia Island Marine Park (MIMP) and developments on Chole Island; her Ph.D. thesis (Walley 1999) is about to be published. Two Tanzanian students have completed masters degrees at the Norwegian College of Fishery Science at the University of Tromsø – both of them carried out research on Mafia Island (Japhnet-Muliyula 2001, Chando 2002). A Norwegian MA student, Rachel Eide, also wrote her dissertation on research carried out on Chole Island (Eide 2000). Dr. Simeon Mesaki of the University of Dar es Salaam has been involved in consultancy research on MIMP for its funders².

In addition to social scientists, there are a number of environmentalists, marine biologists and other scientists who have carried out work on Mafia. Kathryn Clark wrote an M.Phil. dissertation on people and bats on Chole Island (Clark 1994), while the Society for Environmental Exploration (Frontier Tanzania) carried out numerous physical, biological and resource use surveys in the 1990s prior to the establishment of the Marine Park (see for example Horrill and Ngoile 1992, Mayes et al 1992). More recently, the Marine Park itself has begun to generate a series of publications such as its *General Management Plan* (2000) and there are articles about MIMP in the Coastal Partnership newsletter *Dodoji*, first issued in 2002.

Some medical research has also been carried out. A number of researchers have worked on the area of helminths (hookworm) and anaemia (Albonico et al. 2002) while there is a long-standing project to deal with problems of anaemia on

² Unfortunately his reports are confidential and cannot be quoted here.

Chole Island involving DANIDA and the Harvard School of Medicine. In addition, work has been carried out on filariasis.

Getting hold of all this disparate material, some which is published as 'grey literature' and not widely distributed, is a problem. Even the UDSM library only has copies of a limited number of these reports. It is also my impression that many researchers who come to Mafia are not aware of what work has already been carried out, and thus are unable to benefit from it. Further, virtually all of this material is written in English, and that factor, plus its limited distribution, effectively means that it is not available to local people.

2.1. Mafia's current state of development:

Mafia is commonly acknowledged to be one of the least developed Districts in Tanzania, itself a poor country. It has relatively little in the way of infrastructure: no electricity, telephones or running water outside of the District Capital, Kilindoni or the main hotel area of Utende. Travel within the island is difficult because of the lack of vehicles and the poor roads and getting to Dar es Salaam is equally problematic.

The island has a small airport, although the runway is in a poor state. It is served by several charter companies, but the regularity of service depends on the time of year and the level of demand. There are whole periods, especially during the rains, when air travel is erratic. The cost of such travel is way beyond the means of the vast majority of people on the island, including many government servants. Most people use the sailing vessels which ply between Kilindoni and Kisiju, the nearest point on the mainland, where they can get buses or lorries up to Dar es Salaam. The cost of a single trip is T. Sh. 4,000³ (2,500 Mafia-Kisiju, 1,500 Kisiju-DSM). None of the vessels is really suitable for passengers and they lack such basic facilities as life-jackets. Accidents are not unknown, with vessels being lost at sea each year, often along with their crews and passengers. In the summer of 2002, a new ferry service from Mtwara to DSM started to take in Mafia as a stopping point, but its utility is limited by Mafia's lack of a harbour or jetty while its fare, although cheaper than that of the plane, is still well out of the reach for most of the islanders.

Internally, most islanders rely on travel by foot or bicycle, although the latter are only owned by a minority of young males. There is only one regular vehicle passenger service from the northernmost village Bweni to the district capital - a lorry which travels once a day crammed with people (often over 100) and goods, serving all the villages en route. It is relatively expensive by local standards, with tickets costing T.Sh.1000 for a single journey from the north to south. People sometimes get lifts in government vehicles which are visiting outlying areas, especially on the Utende-Kilindoni route which has a slightly heavier traffic. Although the roads have been improved in recent years at considerable expense, their state remains poor especially in the south and as a result vehicle-life is short, and breakdowns frequent. In short, internal travel, like external, is difficult and uncertain.

³ At the time of fieldwork in 2002, the rate of exchange was \$1 = 950 and £1 = T.Sh. 1400.

2.2. Education and health

In recent years, there has been some progress in terms of education and health. All villages are now served by primary schools, although, as will be shown, not all have a sufficient complement of teachers, classrooms, or basic facilities such as desks. Few schools are able to offer housing to their teachers, most of whom come from outside of the island. There is a single secondary school in the south, and plans to extend facilities by building a second one in Kirongwe in the centre of the island.

In health too there has been improvement. Most people live within reasonable reach of a clinic (*zahanati*) and supplies of drugs are more assured than previously. Children are almost all vaccinated and regularly examined up to the age of 5 years. Many women now give birth in clinics. Even so, most *zahanati* do not have their full complement of staff, and housing for staff is also a problem.

3.0. Research Methods

In previous research, I had focused largely on the village level, working especially in Kanga village in the north, with side visits to the neighbouring settlements of Bweni, Mrali and Banja. In this present research, I wanted to consider the island as a whole, which necessitated working at the District level, and examining wider developments such as the Mafia Island Marine Park and the increase in tourism.

Because of the complexity of the topic, it was deemed appropriate to use a mixture of methods, including interviews and focus groups, participant observation, surveys and questionnaires, as well as local records and archives in Dar es Salaam.

3.1. Interviews

Interviews were conducted in villages in the north of the island (mainly Kanga but also Bweni), in the District Capital Kilindoni, in the Marine Park offices and hotels (Utende/Chole), as well as in Dar es Salaam (see list in Appendix 1). Most interviews were semi-structured, which meant that I had a number of pre-prepared questions, but these were always open-ended and new topics often cropped up in the course of the interviews.

3.2. Participant observation

Social anthropologists tend to favour this method, as it is part of the process of immersion into a locality. It means getting involved, if possible as a participant, in whatever is happening. In previous visits, I have joined in activities like harvesting rice, preparing food, dancing, helping out at the village clinic and so on. However, on this visit, because there was so much to do, so many people I needed to talk to and time was so limited, I carried out rather less participant observation than on previous trips. Nonetheless, I did attend a number of village

events such as funerals, a wedding, and a meeting, as well as visiting friends' and neighbours' houses.

3.3. Surveys

I was very fortunate that Mr. Mikidadi Juma Kichange, who I had known since 1965 (when he was twelve years of age) agreed to serve as a Research Assistant. He took leave of absence from his NGO CHAMAMA and we worked together from the beginning of June until the end of August. Prior to that we had been able to hold a planning meeting in April when I was attending a conference in Arusha and so he was able to begin some of his research on a part-time basis prior to my arrival in early June.

Mr. Kichange carried out a number of surveys both in the village and in the district capital. At the village level, he carried out surveys on the following:

- Boat owners in Kanga and Bweni
- Fishermen and their vessels in Kanga and Bweni
- Cattle owners in Kanga
- Migrants from Kanga village to the district capital Kilindoni
- Migrants from Kanga village to Dar es Salaam
- Detailed survey of retail outlets in Kanga and prices

He also conducted a survey of retail outlets and tea houses in Kilindoni.

In addition, Mr. Kichange helped to organise interviews and focus groups in Kanga village, which was invaluable in maximising the use of my time. He also covered for me when I was away, for example, observing and photographing at the annual *Siku ya Mwaka* (solar new year) ceremony (*Mwaka Koga*) in Kanga when I had to be in Kilindoni.

3.4 Use of local records

At the village level, I was able to obtain access to the following records:

- Village registers
- Numerical Records of patients attending Kanga clinic by disease
- Register of follow-up of children aged 0-5, Kanga clinic⁴

At the District level, it did not prove easy to obtain access to office records. There are a number of reasons for this. One is that the records themselves, as many officials admit, are in poor shape. Offices not only lack computers, even typewriters, but they often do not even have filing cabinets or any proper storage systems. As a result, records are exposed to humidity and insects and rapidly deteriorate. Another is that whereas I am well known in Kanga village, this was

⁴ This was to follow-up on earlier work by checking on incidence of underweight children, especially by gender (see Caplan 1999).

the first time I had met most of the government officials, since they rotate posts regularly. Unsurprisingly, I needed to spend time explaining myself and my work.

I was fortunate to be given access by the Mkurugenzi to some of the reports in his office, namely the *Estimates of Income and Expenditure and Development Plans* for the financial years 1998-9, 1999-2000 and 2000-1.

At the District Hospital, I was able to obtain copies of a number of booklets on subjects such as malaria and AIDS, and also some figures on the prevalence of anaemia and HIV/AIDS.

At the headquarters of the Mafia Island Marine Park, I was given copies of the *Micro-Finance Scheme: Report of Survey Findings and Proposal for Strategies* and of the *General Management Plan* (in both English and Swahili)

3.5. Use of National Archives

I visited the Tanzanian National Archives and was able to obtain copies of extracts from the Mafia Island District Books. I had seen these volumes in the *Boma* in Kilindoni back in the 1960s, and had taken some notes at the time. However, it was particularly useful to be able to obtain xerox copies of some material, particularly that pertaining to food imports, and also the population estimates going back to the beginning of the 20th century.

3.6. Making a video and taking photographs

As on previous visits, I took many photos, always ensuring that copies were returned to the subjects. This time I also brought a digital camcorder, which I used mainly in Kanga village, where people know me well and were comfortable with being filmed. I returned home with five hours of footage, which has subsequently been edited and cut into two films: one 45-minute video has an English commentary while the other is somewhat longer and in Swahili. Both focus on life in a village on Mafia Island (see Appendix ??)

There are several purposes of this video. The first is to give back to the people of Mafia, and especially of Kanga, a visual account of their lives, and for it to serve as a record. The second, for English-speakers, is to show what life is like in a village in a remote part of Tanzania. The emphasis where possible is on people speaking for themselves, and on the positive aspects of village life, as well as some of its difficulties.

4.0. Kanga village

I have been carrying out fieldwork in Kanga since 1965, with visits roughly once each decade subsequently (1976, 1985, 1994, 2002 – see bibliography for publications). Topics covered have included kinship and descent, land rights, government policies, gender relations, spirit possession and trance healing, the relation between food health and fertility, personal narratives etc. (see bibliography for references).

During this period the village has grown considerably in size. In 2002, Kanga was a village of 2,833 people, with 373 households, according to the figures kept in the village records⁵. There were 373 households, making for an average household size of 7.59 persons⁶. Thus the population of the village has almost trebled in size since I first worked in it in 1965-7, when my own surveys gave a figure of around one thousand people⁷. Most of this increase is because of the high fertility rates, but there has also been a fair degree of in-migration, especially by Wamakonde originating from Mozambique and southern Tanzania. It was estimated by one of the village officials that there are now around 250 Wamakonde living in the village, almost 10% of the population.

Kanga has an elected Village Council, and is divided into wards, each of which has a representative. In addition, the system of ten-house cell leaders (*wajumbe wa nyumba kumi*) remains in operation⁸. Kanga and Bweni together elect a representative (*Diwan*) to the Mafia District Council. In addition, there are three salaried officials: the Mratibu Kata of Kanga and Bweni, the Ofisa Mtendaji wa Kata (Ward Executive Officer) and the Village Executive Officer. One of these is a local villager, another from Kironawe, and the third from the mainland.

4.1 Changes in the village since 1994

Two positive changes which were immediately striking on my return to Kanga in June 2002, after eight years away, were that the clinic had been completely rebuilt and upgraded, and so had the Primary School. In both cases, the buildings, put up mainly by local labour with materials supplied by government, were impressive, although the school was still adding classrooms. However, their contents left much to be desired.

The Primary school had insufficient desks and other equipment, and the clinic lacked such basic amenities as beds, sheets, mattresses, and towels. It did however have an assured supply of drugs, thanks to support from UNICEF, which were delivered monthly, including disposable needles, which meant that the problem of lack of sterile needles⁹ previously encountered had been solved.

In both the school and the clinic of Kanga, like those elsewhere on the island, the complement of staff was not complete. Kanga had a doctor, health officer,

⁵ The recently published figures from the 2002 census reveal that Kanga and Bweni together have a population of 3,330 (see www.tanzania.go.tz/census/districts/mafia.htm)

⁶ This is at odds with the figures in the census, which suggest that there are 800 households in Kanga and Bweni, and that the average household size is 4.2 persons (bid).

⁷ This would fit with the general increase in the population of Tanzania as a whole, from just over 12m in 1967 when I first carried out fieldwork, to the current 34.5m today.

⁸ This system was a TANU creation and no longer has official status. There have been debates about whether each political party should create its own cells in a similar way.

⁹ In 1985, it was frequently the case that children could not be vaccinated because either there was no kerosene for the fridge in which vaccines were supposed to be kept, or else none for the stoves to boil the water to sterilise the needles. At this time, the Kanga clinic also served the neighbouring village of Bweni, and mothers who had walked 5 miles in the hot sun carrying their babies to be vaccinated were not happy to be told on arrival that no vaccinations could take place that day.

nursing assistant and midwife, but the last was not present during the two months of my stay. To some extent, the shortage of paid staff was ameliorated by the help of four volunteers (*wavi*). Kanga school, like that of the neighbouring Bweni, also had insufficient staff, which meant that classes had to double up.

Furthermore, in the case of both the school and the clinic, teachers and health workers, who almost invariably came from outside the village and usually outside of Mafia, were not always provided with housing. This was a frequent source of complaint for them.

For both school and clinic, and indeed the village as a whole, good records are kept by both workers and volunteers. Unfortunately they lack basic stationery and storage facilities, so that records often get destroyed quickly by insects and humidity.

4.2. Health

In spite of these problems, however, distinct improvements in health were clearly discernible. All children are now being vaccinated against a range of diseases: polio, measles, DPT and BCG. They are also followed up regularly in terms of progress. Far fewer children suffer from scabies than in the past, an observation confirmed by all of the village health workers.

Although on this occasion, I was not focusing on issues on gender differences in failure to thrive and infant mortality, it seemed from the figures available as though this situation, on which I have published elsewhere (Caplan 1999), had definitely improved. People were much more aware of this issue and spoke regularly about the need to ensure that women and girls received adequate food, and that everyone needed foods like green, leafy vegetables to improve iron intake. Some of this was a result of campaigns conducted by UNICEF and local health workers.

Contraception was more readily available than it had been in the past. The doctor reported that about one hundred couples in Kanga were using family planning, but that the vast majority still did not do so. However, conversations with village women indicated that quite a number, married or currently unmarried¹⁰, were seeking contraceptive advice, although the desired family size remained high at 5-6 children. Depo-provera and the contraceptive pill are both available, with the former the more popular choice.

In terms of childbirth, the situation for women is better than it used to be. The clinic has facilities for women giving birth, and more than half¹¹ now have their babies there. There are a number of Traditional Birth Attendants (*wakunga wa jadi*), who keep an eye on pregnant women and help with home births if necessary. Pregnant women are given folic acid and ferrous sulphate.

¹⁰ In my report to COSTECH on research conducted in 1994 (Caplan 1995), I strongly recommended that contraception should be made more widely available, including to women not currently married (see p. 30). This seems to have happened.

¹¹ The estimates I was given varied between a half and three quarters of women giving birth at the clinic

These health improvements, however, were countered by an increase in the incidence of HIV and AIDS. Several deaths which had occurred in my absence were attributed to this disease, including female deaths. Furthermore, some of those who died were resident in the village, rather than, as had been the case in 1994, villagers residing in Dar es Salaam. It is impossible to know what the incidence of HIV/AIDS is at the village level, but figures collected at the District Hospital suggest that the prevalence is 6-9% over the island, with a higher incidence in Kilindoni, and lower in the outlying villages (see section 7.2. below).

Some villagers are concerned about the situation. Here is an extract from an interview with a woman who volunteers at the clinic:

Q. What about AIDS – are you involved?

A. We try to spread the word about AIDS through songs and explanations, including to our own children. We do not have any shame (*haya*) about this any more. There is no sense in it. Prevention is better than cure (*kinga kabla tiba!*)

Q. How many people have died of AIDS in Kanga?

A. About 5 or 6. We talk to everyone – we tell them they have to leave off sleeping around (*uasharati*). And not to share razors and needles, not to care for AIDS patients without wearing gloves, which, however, are not available.

Q. What about condoms?

A. Only the hooligans (*wahuni*) use them, those who go off to town. Almighty God is still watching over us [here in Kanga], but in Kilindoni and Utende, where there is such a mixture of people, it's much worse.

In addition to the growing menace of AIDS, other diseases remained problematic. Malaria is still endemic, and accounts for a high proportion of patients at the clinic. There are intestinal parasites, including hookworm, which exacerbate anaemia (Albonico et al, 2002). Diarrhoea and upper respiratory tract infections also affect a large number of people. Filariasis remains a problem, although there is now a specialist team which visits all the villages in turn¹². The doctor in Kanga noted that the main reasons for illness in the village are mosquitoes, dirty water, lack of latrines, children not wearing shoes, and insufficient food.

According to figures¹³ obtained at the District Hospital, Kanga village has the highest incidence of malnutrition among schoolchildren on the island, with almost all of them showing some symptoms. As in the rest of the island, there is a lack of protein in the diet, a situation which has probably got worse in recent years since more fish are now sold for export from the island, rather than being sold in the villages for food (*kitoweo*). In addition, there is a lack of vegetables and fresh fruit in people's diets. Kanga also scores highly on incidence of anaemia among schoolchildren, although it has one of the lowest incidences of intestinal parasites¹⁴.

¹² The team working on filariasis has doctors from both Cornell Medical School and Muhimbili Hospital.

¹³ It is not clear how these figures were obtained. Other villages also showed high rates of malnutrition among primary school children, ranging from 85-95%.

¹⁴ I was told by the nurse responsible at the District Hospital that hookworm, which affects mainly women and children, has improved recently from a rate of 79% to 52% island-wide thanks to medical treatment.

4.3. Education

The majority of eligible children in the village attend primary school, which has 351 children, made up of 162 girls and 189 boys. In 2001, it was made compulsory in Tanzania for all children of 7+ to attend school and fees were abolished. Primary schools all over the country took in large numbers. On Mafia as a whole, the numbers enrolled almost doubled from 4700 in 1998 to 8085 in 2002. Kanga, for example, admitted 90 children in two classes, which meant that they needed a total of 8 classrooms, but only half that number had been built. In the neighbouring village of Bweni, both Standards 1 and 2 had double-form entries in 2000-1 and 2001-2. Although in Bweni there are six classrooms, there are only six teachers for the 9 classes, and so standards one and two have to operate in rotation in morning and afternoon shifts.

In an interview with the teachers in Bweni, they explained that they really needed nine people, but that they were unlikely to get this complement, because the government worked at a teacher: pupil ratio of 1:45. This made it very difficult for them to complete the prescribed syllabus. The District Education Officer admitted that in many primary schools, the teachers were operating at a ratio of 1:60, with the average for Mafia primary schools being 1:56.

In Kanga and Bweni, the teachers noted that the truancy and drop-out rates had improved somewhat, but remained unacceptably high¹⁵. They attributed this primarily to poverty, noting that the annual cost of keeping a child in primary school is Sh. 16,600¹⁶, a large sum by local standards.

A small number of village children had been sent to the island's secondary school at Kitomondo, just outside of Kilindoni, which teaches Forms 1-4. Although this school is growing, and has a two-form entry in standard one, it has similar problems to the northern village primary schools, as the head-teacher explained:

- The full complement of teachers should be 16, but in fact there are only 10 in post.
- There are only four houses for these 10 teachers.
- There are not enough books to go round¹⁷
- They have no office equipment, not even a typewriter for exam scripts.
- The children come from all over the island, and many have problems with accommodation and food

It is thus scarcely surprising that the achievement rate is low and that not a single child has passed Form 4 sufficiently well to proceed further.

The account of the head-teacher was supplemented by an interview with an ex-student of this school from Kanga which was revelatory:

¹⁵ The District Education Officer quoted a drop-out rate of 38% from primary school in Mafia in 2000, dropping to 27% in 2001.

¹⁶ Shoes – 800, uniform – 10,000, exercise books – 4,800, pens and pencils – 1,000

¹⁷ The District Education Officer said that the pupil-book ratio averaged 3:1 in Mafian primary schools, and that in some it was as high as 6:1.

I passed primary school well enough to go to Kitomondo secondary. But accommodation was a problem. My parents asked a relative if I could stay with her in Kilindoni. She could not refuse, even though she did not really want me there. So every night when I got home I used to have to do a lot of housework. This made it difficult for me to do my homework. My parents knew I was unhappy there, but what could they do? They said 'Stick it out'. But in the end I got low marks and could not continue as I had hoped to do.

I came across instances in the village of a few children who had passed primary school well enough to continue to secondary school but whose parents could not afford the T.Sh 40,000 per annum fees, as well as the other costs of keeping a youngster in secondary school. In a couple of cases, the pupils concerned had been girls and their parents were reluctant to send them away, deeming it better they got married. Given the figures on secondary school drop-out due to pregnancy¹⁸, the concern of parents is understandable. With boys, the drop-out rate is even higher, but this is due primarily to truancy¹⁹ and the temptation to leave school in order to make a living, usually in fishing.

Clearly, then, having a secondary school near to the district capital does not much benefit children from the northern villages. The island administration is aware of this problem, and there are plans afoot to build another secondary school in Kirongwe, in the centre of the island.

Virtually all of the teachers in both primary and secondary schools on the island are mainlanders. Many come from more prosperous parts of Tanzania such as the Kilimanjaro area or Bukoba and many are Christians. They find the Muslim coastal culture quite different from their own, and in many cases alien. Some argue that the schools do not receive sufficient support from the parents, whom they regard as not really interested in their children being educated.

Village parents, on the other hand, often say that they do in fact want their children to receive a modern education, but they complain about the costs of schooling. They also complain about the fact that the teachers are not from Mafia but are *wageni* (strangers) from the mainland who arrange events on Saturdays 'when the children should be in Koran school'.

4.4. Discussion and Summary

Many of the changes which have taken place in the village over the last few years have been positive for the lives of its inhabitants. Many villagers acknowledge this in discussion.

- people are more aware of food for health
- the environment is better cared for

¹⁸ 1998 – 14 girls, 1999 – 4 girls, 2000 – 2 girls, 2001 – 20 girls. I was not able to obtain an explanation for the swings in these figures.

¹⁹ The figures for truancy I was given are as follows: 1998 – 41 boys, 23 girls; 1999 – 60 boys, 35 girls; 2000 – 32 boys, 16 girls; 2001 – 133 boys, 74 girls. Unfortunately it is not made clear whether these figures cover all primary schools, as well as the secondary school, but other data suggest that they do.

- people are better educated than they used to be
- people have really woken up, they know about boiling water, clearing bush, sleeping with a mosquito net, wearing shoes, digging latrines, and eating good healthy food like eggs and fish
- people have recognised the importance of health and education, they built the clinic and the school themselves
- the school and hospital have improved – we are moving along a bit
- women give birth in the clinic – that is a big improvement
- there are women’s groups and other cooperative groups
- there is work for youths – they can get good money for lobsters
- girls can study, even choose their own partners
- women can do what they want, they don’t hide from men

The above list refers to health, to education, and to gender relations. But these views were almost always countered by complaints about an increase in poverty, leading to other problems, including food security.

5.0. Food and food security in Kanga

5.1. Subsistence crops

On Mafia Island, the main subsistence crops are rice (both dry and wet paddy), cassava and sweet potatoes. As I have noted elsewhere (Caplan 1995, 1999), Mafia has not been self-sufficient in food crops since at least German times, scarcely surprising since much of the land is planted with cash crops. Estimates provided by the Agricultural Office in Kilindoni show that there are always deficits, and that in some years, these are severe.

Table 1. Food Production and Demand on Mafia Island, 1996-2002

Ag. year	Estimated pop	Demand (cereals)	Demand (legumes)	Annual prod (tons)	Deficit (tons)
1995-6	39,305	10,127	3586.2	6542 (64.5%)	3,585 (35.4%)
1996-7	42,574	10,971	3885	2763 (25%)	8208 (75%)
1997-8	43,763	11,277	3993	4258 (38%)	7019 (62%)
98-99	46,143	11,962.6	4210.5	8113.3 (68%)	3849.3 (32%)
99-2000	47,333	12197	4319	7180.5 (58%)	5138.5 (42%)
2000-1	48,523	12504	4428	8397.75 (67%)	4106.25 (33%)
2001-2	49,713	12811	4547.9	645.9 (67.5%)	4165.1 (32.5%)

As can be seen, the annual deficits range from one third to three quarters of requirements. The size of the harvest is primarily determined by the level of

rainfall, although insect pests such as edible grasshoppers (*nyavule*) may also be significant factors. The north of the island is more self-reliant in food than the south, since there are large amounts of bush land cultivated on a shifting pattern, but even here most households cannot feed themselves and need to buy food. In years when the rains are insufficient or when insects or other animal pests such as wild pigs or monkeys consume part of the harvest, there will be greater dependence upon shop-bought food. Similarly food will need to be bought in households where there is insufficient labour to clear land, plant, weed, guard and harvest the crop. According to the agricultural office in Kilindoni, there is currently less labour available for cultivation than a few years ago, since many able-bodied men now spend much of their time fishing (see below).

5.2. Cash crops

On Mafia Island, coconuts are the main cash crop and have been so since German times, when every man was required to plant at least one hundred trees. In Kanga village, this requirement changed both the settlement patterns and the economy, as people moved down from the ridge in the centre of the island, where they kept large herds of cattle, nearer to the sandy soil of the coast, which was more suitable for coconut trees.

When I first visited Mafia in the 1960s, the major use for coconuts was for copra, and it was sold through government-backed cooperative societies. By the 1970s, the cooperatives were scarcely functioning any more and people tended to export their nuts direct to Dar es Salaam, where they fetched a good price in the market because they were used for cooking. This continued into the 1980s when the economy began to be liberalised, and cooking oil to be imported, leading to a decline in demand from city-dwellers for coconuts. By the time of my visit in 1994, people on Mafia were complaining that the costs of transport of nuts to Dar es Salaam by dhow and lorry, plus the costs of the levy (*ushuru*), had made profits very small, with a concomitant decrease in cash income.

By 2002, the profits on the export of nuts to Kariakoo market in Dar had shrunk still further, and many people did not bother to send them there. Even the big plantations in the south of the island had ceased to be profitable, and were weed-infested. One reason for this was local competition e.g. from other parts of the coast, including Kenya. Another was that world production had increased, yet demand for coconuts had decreased²⁰.

The second cash crop is cashew-nuts, which grow more profusely in the south than the north. On my various visits to Mafia over the last four decades I have seen the price obtained for nuts fluctuating wildly, and indeed, on one occasion, some northern villagers told me that they were grubbing up their trees because no money could be made. In 2002, the market was only a little better, although there were plans afoot in Kilindoni to spray the trees with sulphur powder to prevent fungal disease and thus improve the crop.

²⁰ For example, copra used to be an important ingredient of soap but now replacements such as tallow are used.

5.3. Bought food

At the village level in Kanga, most people purchased food they could not grow from the village shops. The shop-keepers in turn went regularly to Dar es Salaam to purchase supplies, rather than obtaining it in Kilindoni where it was considerably more expensive than in Dar. Kanga village, for example, has fifteen shops, all of them selling foodstuffs such as rice, maize flour, wheat flour, sugar, and tea. Everyone complained about the increases in the price of purchased food and said, given the drop in the prices of coconuts, they had less cash than before with which to purchase it.

At the District level, Kilindoni is well served by some forty shops, many of which sell food, and by a market. The following table shows the range of food which is available and the range of prices for which it is sold in Kilindoni and in Kanga village:

Table 2. Prices of food sold in shops in Kilindoni and Kanga village, Mafia Island, summer 2002.

Item	Price range per kg in T.Sh	
	Kilindoni	Kanga village
Rice (<i>mchele</i>)	300-400	320-400
Wheat flour (<i>unga ungoro</i>)	320-350	270-380
Maize flour (<i>sembe</i>)	280-340	280-350
Beans (<i>maharage</i>)	350-460	370-400
Sugar	550-600	600-650

In addition to the above staples, people in Kilindoni could purchase vegetables (potatoes, sweet potatoes, onions, garlic, cabbage, tomatoes, spinach, carrots) and fruit (oranges, lemons, limes, mangoes, papaya), some of it locally grown but fewer of these items were available in the village.

5.4. Views on imported food

Prior to the liberalisation of the Tanzanian economy which took place in the late 1980s and 1990s, most of the rice imported to Mafia came from the Rufiji Delta, or from other parts of Tanzania. The big difference now is that much rice is imported from various parts of Asia. Local people find it hard to understand how rice brought from so far away can be cheaper than rice grown in their own country. They also mistrust the foreign rice:

Extract 1: Interview with MJ, a middle-aged man, Kanga village 160702

People today don't have enough strength because they don't eat as well [as they used to do]. The food they eat comes from all over the place, some of it's alright, but some of it isn't....

Q. So is the food which is grown here better?

A. Yes, first of all it's heavy (*kizito*), the other [kind of food] is very light (*chepesi*). A person has to fill their stomach, but these days people don't feel satisfied!

Extract 2: Interview with SA, a middle-aged man, Kanga village 170702

Q. What about the food people eat nowadays?

A. The [imported] food has its problems – it's been around for years before it gets sold. It like medicine – you shouldn't use it after its due date [has expired]. So can it be real food?

Nonetheless, poverty obliges many people to buy and consume such food.

6.0. Making a living in the village

Mention has already been made above of the drop in the prices of cash crops. However, there is one source of cash income which has expanded in recent years, namely fishing. There is considerable demand in the North (Europe, North America) and in Japan and Australasia for sea products, not least because of the depletion of supplies in these areas because of over-fishing. In addition, people earn cash through keeping cattle and goats, through trade and by doing casual work in the village, or by being employed outside of the village. All of these avenues are considered in this section.

6.1. Fishing

There has been a noticeable increase in fishing activities on the island in the years that I have been observing there. Today in the north, more villagers, especially young men, are engaged in this activity, including fishing for finfish, crustaceans (lobsters, crayfish), and cephalopods (octopus and squid), as well as seeking other sea products like sea cucumbers (*majongoo ya bahari*) to sell for cash. Some fish are sold fresh in the village, others are smoked and taken to Dar. Few of the fishermen in the north supply the fish processing factory in Kilindoni because the prices are low, and the journey long and expensive. They prefer to take fish all the way to Dar es Salaam and sell in the market there.

Men fish using lines (*mishipi*) or nets (*nyavu*), as well as traps such as *madema* and *wando*. Some work singly or in pairs, others in larger groups. Some fishing, especially that for lobsters and crayfish, involves diving in deep water, using a mask, and that activity is largely confined to younger men. Crustaceans are sold both in Dar es Salaam, and also to traders from the south of the island who come to purchase in the north.

In Kanga village, there are 44 men who fish on a regular basis. Eighteen of these have outrigger canoes (*ngalawa*). There are also two dhows (*majahazi*), three small dhows (*mashua*) and two boats (*maboti*) with outboard motors. These figures are lower than in the smaller neighbouring village of Bweni, which has 4 boats, 6 *mashua* and 5 *dhows*, and where fishing is the main economic activity. While canoes are regularly used for fishing, dhows and boats are used rather for transport of fish and other goods to the mainland or to Dar. A canoe costs between 20,000 and 120,000 Tanzanian shillings, which is within the reach of a number of people.

However, only the wealthier villagers can afford the costs of bigger vessels, since a dhow costs between 2 and 5 million Tanzania shillings, a mashua between 500,000 to 3 million, and a boat between 500,000 and 800,000.

On Mafia, not only do more local people engage in fishing than previously, but many outsiders come to the island for this purpose for longer or shorter periods, either to fish themselves or to buy fish, crustaceans or cephalopods from local fishermen. Fishermen in the south of the island are more likely to sell to the fish processing factory (see section 9.2) from which they also obtain loans of improved gear.

6.2. Keeping cattle

According to the Agricultural Office, there are some 12,000 cattle and 600 goats on the island²¹. Some five per cent of these are to be found in the village of Kanga.

As was mentioned previously, the villagers of Kanga used to live up on the ridge to the west of the present village, where the land was suitable not only for subsistence agriculture, but also for keeping cattle. In spite of the fact that they now live nearer the coast, they still keep many cattle, and herdsmen take the animals up to the ridge on a daily basis for pasture. Cattle are sold to be slaughtered at big rituals such as funerals and weddings, and also at spirit healing rituals. It is rare for people to slaughter an animal just in order to sell the meat.

Almost one hundred people in the village today own 600 cattle, the vast majority of them men – only five women own any cattle. Many owners have only a handful of animals, but a few (16) have more than ten, and some (5) even own more than 20 animals. The vast majority of these animals are African *zebu* cattle, whose value in 2002 was between 50,000 and 70,000 Tanzanian shillings. Only two owners have the larger, 'improved' breed of cattle (*ng'ombe bora*)²² whose value is much greater at 80-140,000/-. In spite of these large numbers of animals, the amount of milk produced is quite small. Some herdsmen supply the village tea-houses, but it is difficult for ordinary households to obtain regular supplies of milk and there is no export market from the village.

A further 21 people, again mostly male, own 76 goats, whose value is only between 10 and 15,000/- and 16 people own 27 donkeys, used for transporting goods, especially coconuts, from the village to the vessels on the beach. The value of donkeys, at 60-75,000/- each, is lower than that of cattle.

²¹ Mafia ranks second among districts in the Coastal Region after Bagamoyo in the number of cattle kept.

²² A scheme was set up in the 1980s to improve local cattle through breeding with European breeds. The resulting animals were not only larger, but also had a much larger milk yield. However, such animals require a good deal of care and expensive medication, so some who have tried using the improved breed have reverted to the zebu cattle who are much more hardy. Part of the problem in Kanga is the lack of a market to sell milk at an economic price, since transport difficulties militate against export from the village. Further south, in villages like Baleni, the scheme has been more successful as cattle owners and herders can take or send their milk to Kilindoni.

6.3. Local employment

On Mafia Island, there is relatively little regular waged employment available. In Kanga village, for example, the only people earning regular salaries are teachers, health workers, and government officials. There is sometimes labouring work (*kibarua*) available: clearing a field, felling coconuts, building or repairing a house.

In Kilindoni the main employer again is the government, with people working in offices at the *Boma* as civil servants, secretaries, guards (there is a jail in the district capital), police, court officials, health workers. The private sector has recently expanded with the enlargement of the fish processing factory, formerly known as Hellas, which is now owned by the Tanpesca Company. In addition to the managers and technicians, all of whom come from outside the island (some even from outside of Tanzania), a number of local people are employed at hourly rates. Some of the shop-keepers hire shop-assistants, and there are a number of workshops dealing in carpentry and vehicle repair, as well as stalls in the market and on the beach selling food, both raw and ready-cooked, and other items.

However, the phrase '*Hatuna kazi yeyote hapa*' (we don't have any work at all here) is frequently heard. People say that they would like more employment opportunities because they need more cash for their daily needs.

As a result of this dearth of employment, there is a steady migration from the villages. Some go to the District Capital. A quick survey revealed that some 45 adults from Kanga village, with ages ranging between 19 to 56 years had moved to Kilindoni. Virtually all of these have completed primary education, and a few have had some secondary schooling. Half of these people are women married to men living and working in the district capital and only few of them have any paid occupation. Male occupations include the following: driver (2), builder, court clerk, carpenter (3), bike repairer, fish factory (2), paramedic, secondary school student (3).

Secondly, there is migration from the island to the mainland, especially to Dar es Salaam, and there seems little doubt that this has increased in recent years. From Kanga village, for example, there are at least 80 adults living in Dar es Salaam. Their occupations include the following:

Table 3. Occupations of Kanga migrants to Dar es Salaam

Selling coconuts – 6
 Private sector companies – 7
 Own small business (usually stall) – 19
 Health workers – 2
 Selling fish – 3
 Teacher – 4
 Government employees – 8
 Drivers (sector unspecified) – 7
 Housewives - 6

From the above figures, which are by no means precise, it can be seen that most people work in the informal sector (selling coconuts, mats or fish in the markets, or having their own small stall). Rather fewer have regular formal sector employment, whether in the public or private sector, partly because of the dearth of such employment, and partly because migrants from Mafia generally lack educational qualifications.

6.4. Discussion: the shortage of cash

There is a serious dearth of cash in the local economy on Mafia, especially at the village level. Because of the heavy dependence upon coconuts for cash over the last one hundred years, islanders have been hard hit by the dramatic drop in prices of recent years. At the same time, the prices of shop-bought goods have continued to rise inexorably, especially since the removal of subsidies and price controls on food.

New opportunities, such as the rise in the demand for fish and crustaceans for export, have mainly benefited younger males, who may not be willing to spend their cash on household support, but rather prefer to acquire consumer goods such as bicycles and radios. They also like to pay to watch the video films which are screened in the village, a venue which women never attend, and older men only rarely.

Meanwhile the situation for women in terms of economic opportunities has changed little at the village level. As we have seen women own little in the way of capital, are responsible for most of the agricultural and household labour (see Caplan 1995d and 1995e) and have few opportunities for earning cash. As in the 1960s, women continue to collect and dry raffia (*ukindu*), and plait and dye the resultant strips to sew into mats (*mikeka*). But the prices they obtain are very low – traders who buy in the village pay around Sh. 1500/-2000 per mat, while they retail in the city for Sh. 6-8,000/-.

The problem with the shortage of cash in the local economy is not only that many households are extremely poor and do not have enough cash to make ends meet, which is bad enough, but that this is a vicious circle. Poor households cannot spend cash which would benefit other households (e.g. shop-keepers) and they find it difficult to educate their children, especially at secondary level, thereby perpetuating the status quo.

Furthermore, the shortage of cash to buy even such necessities as food means that there are ongoing problems of malnutrition. One very dedicated health worker, who had spent many years on Mafia, reported as follows:

When I do home visits, I often find people who haven't eaten since the day before and I myself give them money and/or food. Some of it comes from my own resources and some I beg from government offices.

7.0. Kilindoni – the District Capital

Kilindoni is a small settlement, with a collection of some 40 shops, a market, a harbour, and an area of government offices (*boma*). Outside the main settlement are an airstrip and the District Hospital.

The survey carried out by Mikidadi Kichange showed 40 establishments which could be classified as ‘shops’ proper. There is a relatively small degree of specialisation – most shops sell foodstuffs of the kind already discussed above (see Section 5.3), and also carry mosquito spray, toiletries (toothpaste, soap), batteries, matches, stationery (pens, pencils, exercise books). Many also sell clothes, especially *khanga* and *vitenge*. Both in the centre of the town, especially in the market, and also close to the harbour, there are a number of teashops (*mahoteli*, *migahawa*) which sell refreshments such as cups of tea, boiled eggs, kebabs, chapatis, pilao and soup.

In this section, I first consider government officials and their role, then the District Hospital, and finally the role of NGOs.

7.1 Government officials and their role

Mafia constitutes a District (*Wilaya*) of the Coastal Region (*Mkoa wa Pwani*) of Tanzania. The senior-most government official is the District Commissioner (*Mkuu ya Wilaya*), assisted by the District Executive Director (DED – *Mkurugenzi wa Maendeleo wa Wilaya*). There are 14 government departments²³, and interviews were conducted in six of them²⁴, as well as on several occasions with the DC and the DED. As already discussed, interviews were also held with government employees working at the village level, including teachers and medical workers.

7.1.1. Problems encountered by government officials

Many government employees spoke about the problems they encountered in their work. First and foremost were the low salaries: teachers, many health workers, and others are paid at the minimum wage rate of 50,000 per month. This was often not enough to live on, and certainly not to support a family, especially, as was often the case, no house was provided and rent had to be found. The remark of one man ‘No matter how carefully I budget, I can’t make my salary last for the month’ was echoed by many.

The majority of employees had been posted to Mafia from other parts of Tanzania and were far from home. Visiting their home areas was difficult and expensive, and, while they were supposed to have fares paid once a year, they

²³ Afya (Health), Ardhi (Land), Biashara (Trade), Elimu (Education), Fedha (Finance), Kilimo (Agriculture), Maendeleo ya Jamii (Community Development), Maji (Water), Mali Asili (Natural Resources), Mipango (Planning), Ujenzi (Building), Ushirika (Cooperatives), Utawala (Manpower), Uvuvi (Fisheries).

²⁴ Land, Trade, Agriculture, Development, Planning and Cooperatives. Unfortunately, officers were sometimes away when I was in Kilindoni, so it was not possible to interview more people.

often did not receive a reimbursement. Very few could afford to fly, and they found the journey by *mashua* and lorry to Dar es Salaam difficult and potentially dangerous: 'I have to take my wife and five kids on a *mashua*. You get to Kisiju (the nearest point on the mainland) and you have to wait. Then the vehicle comes [to take you to Dar] – it's not a luxury bus, it's a lorry!'

Many complained that the lack of travel facilities on the island also made their jobs very difficult. Some said that their departments used to get bicycles or motor scooters, or even a vehicle, but this had now ceased, and they had to get around as best they might: 'We have to go around everywhere on foot carrying whatever we need, and it's very tiring'. As a result, they were not able to do the amount of outreach work in villages they would have wished.

In many offices, there had been staff cuts²⁵. Employees who left were not replaced, either because of budget cuts, or because civil servants would do their best not to be posted to Mafia, widely regarded as backward and isolated. Two men working in one office said that a few years ago, there had been five. There had also been a diminution in training courses, which meant that promotion prospects were not always good.

It was clear from visiting them that the majority of government offices are badly equipped. There is only one functioning computer in the Boma, and most of the remaining offices do not even have typewriters. Some staff complained that they even had to buy their own paper and pens to be able to do their work.

A source of discontent was a comparison between their lot and that of people higher up in the system, including MPs. Many of them mentioned the second presidential plane²⁶ which had just been agreed, and the huge pensions on which MPs retire compared with their own: 'MPs get 6 lakhs²⁷ a month and a pension after 5 years. Government servants may work for a pittance for 40 years and then get a tiny pension' said one. Another said that 'The free market has led to a huge growth in inequality' and that 'Globalisation is affecting us badly – we will end up eating grass'.

In the light of the above, it is remarkable that some of the offices function as well as they do, and that morale is not lower than it is.

7.2.2. *How did government officials see Mafia?*

First of all, they regarded it as very backward, especially by comparison with their own home areas, or with Dar es Salaam, or other areas in which they had worked. They complained about its poor infrastructure – lack of roads, electricity, running water, and telephones. Some of them noted that Mafia has the lowest income of any part of TZ, that the price of coconuts had dropped and there is no

²⁵ As a result of the Structural Adjustment Programmes in Tanzania, there had been a policy of retrenchment in the civil service since 1996.

²⁶ In the 2002 Budget, the purchase of a second presidential plane was agreed to, in spite of many criticisms from the Tanzania media. This example was often cited by people on Mafia.

²⁷ One *lakhi* is T.Sh 100,000.

market for cashews. Handicrafts are poor quality because of poor materials, so they do not sell easily.

Yet many recognised that solutions were not easy and there were often conflicting interests. For instance, conservation of the environment was thought to encourage tourism but discourage certain kinds of economic developments²⁸. They also talked about the problem of corruption.

I asked what happened when national and local ideas differed. One official told me

We first try and explain the plans and their importance to the locals through the village council and the District Councillors. If they still don't agree, their points will be discussed at District level. We used to have top-down planning, But then we saw that we should support what people want e.g. if they want a well, then you don't give them nets. We also ask their priorities, because we don't have enough resources for everything.

But there is another issue and that is how government officials, especially non-Mafians, perceive local people. Many of the former see the latter, especially the men, as lazy. They are also said to be lacking in entrepreneurial spirit and dominated in trade by middlemen who get most of the profits. In addition, local culture is thought to be a problem and an obstacle to development.

'Culture' was usually ill-defined, and seemed to include a whole constellation of issues. One such was religion – most locals are Muslims, most government servants from outside are Christians. Another was levels of education, but often also glossed as 'ignorance' as one junior official explained:

Ignorance is prevalent, they cannot decide for themselves, they are not able to utilise opportunities which are right there around them

Q. Why do you think they are ignorant?

They haven't been to school, but also it is a question of confusion. There are ways of learning by seeing other places, and learning from them. Either people don't leave here or don't see when they do.

Another man in the same office joined in the conversation:

I worked before in Kibaha. Admittedly it's bigger, but people there do try to look for their own resources, use what is around and find ways of doing things. On Mafia, they wait for the government or the NGOs.

Yet some were sympathetic to the plight of Mafians, citing their low incomes, the fall in coconut prices, the low level of technology in fishing.

Their existence is hand to mouth, so it's difficult to get them to do anything else because they have to earn their daily bread.

²⁸ One officer mentioned the fruit bats which breed in large numbers on Chole Island. They are mentioned in all the tourist literature and are a protected species. However, they are now migrating to other parts of Mafia and becoming a considerable nuisance to crops.

7.2.3 Proposed solutions to the problems of Mafia

I asked many of them what they saw as the solutions to the problems of Mafia and the following were mentioned:

- Build a jetty so that ships could bring tourists, travel for locals would be easier
- Improve the airport for similar reasons so that there would be more planes and lower-priced fares
- Find more donors to support basic needs such as additional health centres and primary schools
- Build another secondary school
- Set up a twinning programme for the secondary school with a school abroad which would give assistance of various kinds
- Find more investors including those who would build more hotels and encourage (eco-)tourism, and/or develop fishing and prawn farming
- Set up more small income-generating groups (vikundi)
- Persuade local people to grow more food, including bananas and sweet potatoes, and sell the surplus
- Persuade local people to eat an improved diet, especially green leafy vegetables (*mchicha*) and to drink milk
- Improve the cashew-nut crop through sulphur dusting and give agricultural education in general

This list involves several agents:

- a) investors, to bring in money and set up new enterprises (hotels, fishing etc.)
- b) donors, to give money for worthy causes
- c) local people, who should work harder and eat better food, set up co-operative groups
- d) government officials themselves, who should encourage all of the above

Furthermore, while ideas about *what* should be done were not lacking, ideas about *how* such tasks should be accomplished and who was responsible were often left vague. This was seen either as the job of their seniors, or else, quoting the current discourse, supposed to emerge from the felt needs of the local population. Where the resources were to come from was also usually left unspecified.

7.2. The District Hospital

The District Hospital was re-built around 1970, but by 2002, the state of most of the buildings was poor²⁹. Furthermore, much basic equipment was lacking, and there was a shortage of medical personnel, in spite of the fact that the hospital was then seeing almost 70,000³⁰ patients per annum. Here is an extract from an interview with one of the employees:

²⁹ There are some graphic photos of this hospital on the website of Remote Medicine www.remotemedicine.org

³⁰ In 2001, the hospital saw 67,741 patients

Fifty people work in this hospital but that is way below complement. We have a big problem with personnel – every time someone goes away the shortage becomes acute. We have only one fully trained doctor (M.D.) and he also has a lot of administration to do. Next week a number of the senior staff have to go and present a budget, so they will not be here³¹. There is no secretary, no accountant, no computer. A lot of the posts are not filled (see Appendix 3).

There are big problems of bureaucracy in getting staff – we have to send requests through the DED and he passes them on. But it means that people are often having to do jobs for which they are not trained – it is the medical attendant in the x-ray department who does the x-rays, the doctors administer anaesthesia – or instruct the nurses. We have no generator, oxygen, or suction machine. If the electricity fails, we have to go and borrow a generator from the MP's office.

The same situation obtains in *zahanati* in the villages. There are twelve of them on Mafia, and there should be two clinical officers in each, but in fact there are only two for the whole of Mafia! There should be two public health nurse B in each clinic – but there is only one in the whole district. All in all, the full complement of clinic staff should be 60, but in fact there are only 39 people.

I thought if I studied I could help people, but I am very frustrated. And it is very difficult to manage on my salary. None of my promotions has resulted in an increment.

In an interview with another worker, I ask about how they get supplies of drugs. It is clear that they come from a wide variety of different sources:

- Medicine for hookworm – Tanzania Food and Nutrition Centre
- Medicine for malnutrition – Public Health Institute
- Ferrous Sulphate for anaemia – WHO
- Medicine and treatment for filariasis – American health team from Cornell
- Antibiotics and some other drugs – National AIDS control
- Infant feeding – UNICEF

This policy is based on what is termed the 'Multi-sectoral' approach, but it is clearly not the most efficient way of obtaining resources – it is rather a question of getting whatever one can from wherever possible.

Furthermore, HIV/AIDS appears to be spreading on Mafia. The only figures available are from the analysis of 358 people who were blood donors and whose blood has been screened since 1990. This shows as follows:

³¹ In fact, as I was interviewing another member of staff subsequently, we were interrupted by a young nurse who came to report that there were many patients waiting and that not a single doctor was to be found because they were all attending a seminar.

Table 4. Incidence of HIV/AIDS on Mafia Island, as shown by blood donors

Year	Numbers tested	Nos with AIDS	of whom women
1990	43	0	0
1991	161	9	0
1992	297	11	0
1993	235	14	4
1994	204	11	3
1996	199	13	3
1997	264	11	1
1998	294	14	5
1999	259	24	8
2000	170	15	5
2001	187	24	14

They have already found 4 cases in the first quarter of 2002.

The above figures suggest that between 6% and 9% of the population is affected, but there seems little doubt that more people in the south, especially around Kilindoni, are likely to have AIDS. A nurse at the hospital drew particular attention to the vulnerability of young women: 'They want nice things they see their friends getting, so they engage in sex'.

I asked one of the medical staff at the hospital how AIDS patients are treated.

If we see someone with symptoms, we screen them. If they are positive, we treat symptomatically. Only five hospitals in Tanzania have anti-retroviral drugs so far, there is nothing at the Regional or District level. We encourage women to eat very well as it helps their immunity. And during birth we use episiotomies to enlarge the canal. We don't use scissors to cut the umbilical cord any more, only disposable blades. We also use oral suction during birth to stop the vaginal fluids coming into contact with the baby as much as possible.

He argued further that there was not nearly enough AIDS awareness and education: 'We don't do enough seminars because we don't have enough money – we just do it once a year on AIDS day. ... From January to June of this year (2002) there has been no AIDS activity at all. All we [at the hospital] do is to help MICAS (a local voluntary group – see below) with the use of our vehicle'.

7.3. Non-governmental organisations

There are four non-governmental (NGO) organisations based in Kilindoni:

- MICAS (Mafia Island Club against AIDS and other STDS)
- CHAMAMA – Changio cha Maendeleo Mafia (Association for the Development of Mafia)
- Tasisi ya Dini (Grouping of Religions)
- Kimama (Women's Organisation)

7.3.1. MICAS

In 2001, a new organisation³² was founded to combat AIDS: Mafia Island Club Against AIDS and other STDS (MICAS). MICAS holds meetings throughout the island, at which they use a variety of media – sports, songs, skits – to raise awareness about HIV and AIDS. Members also run seminars at which they demonstrate how to use condoms. They also operate an advice bureau in Kilindoni. In all of these fora, they give information about how AIDS is transmitted, and advise people against potentially dangerous practices, not only unsafe sex, but also cutting the uvula³³ or having boys circumcised by ritual specialists using one razor for a group of children (see Caplan 1976).

I discussed the need for such an organisation with the founder:

Q. Why did you decide to start it?

A. Because we saw a lot of problems at the hospital with people who didn't know they had AIDS and who were suffering from opportunistic infections. There has also been an increase in STDs such as genital rashes, gonorrhoea, herpes simplex, lymphogranuloma, and PID in women. We thought not enough was being done to teach (*elimisha*) people and that people would have to help themselves.

Q. So how do you teach people?

A. We hold meetings, and suggest that people form their own branches.

Q. And do people listen to you?

A. There are people who are difficult, who use religion for example. We give out condoms and show people how to use them (there are two models of erect penises which they use for demonstrations) but we don't do this in large groups, we get together small groups of people of the same age. The condoms are made in China or Kenya.

Q. What advice do you give women about breast-feeding?

A. Because the risks of not breastfeeding are so great, we advise them to breast feed and to give nothing else for 4 months, and then to wean the child and give other foods.

Q. Are any anti-retroviral drugs available?

A. No we don't have them on Mafia. Nor do we have the vaccinations which help prevent maternal transmission.

7.3.2. Chamama

Changia Maendeleo Mafia has been in existence for some years, and was set up by a group of Mafians dissatisfied with the slow rate of development on the island. Most of the members are well-educated and work as professionals and civil servants. Some of the members live and work in Dar es Salaam, others on the island, and there are two Committees: one Dar and the other Kilindoni-based. In the District Capital it has a small office, in Dar, the committee meets in members' houses.

³² In the summer of 2002 MICAS was still classified as a 'Community-based organisation' (CBO), and not yet registered as an NGO, not least because of the necessity to raise 120,000 Tanzania shillings for registration.

³³ Cutting the uvula (*kukata kilimi*) is a common remedy for bad coughs and is done by local specialists.

Chamama has been involved in a number of projects:

- pushing for the setting up of the first Secondary School on Mafia which finally opened at Kitomondo in 1993 (?)
- trying to raise funds for an Islamic secondary school based on an existing *madrasa (Madrasatul Khairiyah)* in the north of the island.
- Setting up a co-operative group of fishermen in the north of the island – this was called ‘*nyundo*’ (hammer)
- Applying for funds to set up maternal health and AIDS awareness and educational programmes – in 2002 they succeeded in obtaining some money from CARE³⁴
- setting up an environmental subgroup known as WEMESAKU (Weka Mazingira ya Mafia Safi na Kupendeza – Keep the environment of Mafia clean and beautiful). Wemesaku has also tried raise funds for afforestation projects.

7.3.3. *Kimama*

This is a women’s group of some twenty members which started in 2001 as a way of generating income for women. It has been involved in the following projects:

- environmental cleanliness
- growing flowers
- planting trees
- cooking for big ceremonies (e.g. weddings)
- setting up a vegetable garden
- keeping chickens
- buying soft drinks to sell at a profit
- mother and child health project, for which they also obtained funding from CARE.

The leader of this group has good relations with senior government officials, and has managed to obtain a small office in the Boma. She has also been chosen as a District Council representative (*Diwan*) for one of the three seats reserved for women.

7.3.4. *Tasisi ya Dini*

Mafia is predominantly Muslim, although there has long been a population of plantation workers from the mainland, many of whom are Christian, and the majority of government servants posted in from outside tend also to be Christian. The Catholic church sent its first priest to Mafia in 1995, and has recently become more active, including being involved in a number of development projects:

- setting up an agricultural advice office
- bringing in two nuns to give health advice

³⁴ CARE was set up in the USA during World War II and its initials originally stood for ‘Committee for American Relief to Europe’ but the acronym now stands for ‘Cooperation for Assistance and Relief Everywhere, Inc’. Its headquarters remains in the US. See www.careusa.org for further information.

- repairing and re-equipping two wards in the District Hospital
- setting up a nursery
- setting up Tasisi ya Dini, which involves Christians of several denominations, as well as Muslims

In recent years, the number of immigrants, especially Wamakonde, most of whom are Christian, has increased and there are now several churches on the island, including, including Anglicans, Assemblies of God, Evangelical Lutherans, and Seventh Day Adventists.

Tasisi ya Dini has also been able to obtain funding from CARE in order to promote AIDS awareness.

7.4. Discussion and Summary

This section has focused on the interviews which were conducted in Kilindoni, especially with the government officials, health workers and NGOs activists. It can be seen that there are very differing ideas about the development of Mafia, but all agree that Mafia has many problems, is extremely poor, and 'something needs to be done' to improve the lives of its people. The two solutions most frequently put forward are the development of tourism, and an expansion in the fishing industry. In the next two sections, I consider each of these in turn.

8.0 Tourist developments on Mafia

For many years, the only hotel which existed on the island was the Mafia Island Fishing Club, located at Utende on the south-east corner. Here people came from all over Eastern and Southern Africa, and further afield, for 'big game' fishing: catching barracuda, shark and other large fish. The hotel even had its own small airstrip, which has now fallen into disuse. Later it was rebuilt and renamed the Mafia Island Lodge, and was owned by the Tanzania Tourist Board.

In recent years, three new tourist hotels have been built: two of them in Utende (Kinasi and Polepole Bungalow Resort) and one on Chole Island (Chole Mjini). All of these lie within the boundaries of the Mafia Island Marine Park (see section 9.1). In addition, there are now two hotels in Kilindoni which cater mainly for Tanzanian guests: the Lizu Hotel in the centre of town, opened in 1993, and the Harbour View Hotel, opened in 2001. Interviews took place with owners or managers of all hotels.

8.1. Mafia Island Lodge

At the time of my visit, this hotel had the lowest rate of bookings, mainly because it was in the process of being sold. I was told that the marketing company responsible for publicity had effectively stopped functioning. In 2002 the majority of their guests were visiting dignitaries, with only a handful of tourists, and the 40-room hotel was mainly almost empty³⁵.

³⁵ In an email received in July 2003, I heard that the hotel had finally been sold.

8.2. Kinasi Lodge

Kinasi advertises itself as follows:

Small, family-run lodge with only 12 rooms set in landscaped gardens above the water's edge. Stylishly designed for considerate creature comforts, with library of local information and nightly cocktails. Swimming pool and beach bar, great diving and world class fishing (www.tanzaniaodyssey.com).

Another more detailed description appears on www.tanzania-web.com/mafia/mafia.html:

The intention has been to create a resort that is well appointed and artistic, relaxing. Kinasi is therefore beautifully furnished with designer furniture... The dining room is appointed with very good crockery and hand blown glassware, as well as original antiques.

Kinasi has already established a reputation for excellent seafood and a fine wine list... Service will continue to concentrate on excellence in food and drink.

This hotel, originally functioning only as a tented camp, was set up in 1997 by an Australian who had previously worked on Mafia and is a Tanzanian resident. I asked the manager what kind of clients they had and she replied that it was mostly younger guests such as honeymooners, people who wanted a relaxing holiday after climbing Kilimanjaro, and those interested in scuba diving. They came mainly from Britain, Italy, Germany and Switzerland.

The owner told me that he planned to upgrade the hotel still further 'to five-star standard', and that he hoped to acquire a plot on a northern beach to set up a beach hotel which would be outside the perimeter of the Marine Park.

8.3. Polepole Bungalow Resort

On its website, this hotel advertises itself as having 'tasteful luxury' (www.polepole.com) and, in the welcome leaflet for guests, as a 'small luxury eco-resort'. It was founded some eight years earlier by a young Italian couple, who are Tanzanian residents. One of them, Katia Palazzo, is an anthropologist who has made a study of the local area which she has written up as a thesis (Palazzo 1999). They began to work on the hotel in 1995 and opened three years later. Katia Palazzo explained the conception behind the resort: 'A small resort compatible with the environment, using local, low-impact materials. It should be eco-friendly, and also concerned with local people.' She explained that at first they had tried to run the hotel themselves, but soon realised that marketing was crucial, so moved to Dar es Salaam where it was easier to engage in publicity. 'We established a niche market: divers, people interested in the environment and the Marine Park'.

I asked about how they recruited their staff and she told me that their policy was local recruitment:

We could bring staff from outside who would be more professional than the ones we have now, but we have preferred to have mainly local staff. I wanted to recruit local people with a high level of dignity, and work on them through their pride, not just for money. So you have to spend your evenings talking to them, teaching them [what they need to know].

She talked about the problems of a venture of this kind: in 1998, the bombings of the American embassies in Nairobi and Dar es Salaam had discouraged tourists from coming to East Africa, as did the crash of a Swiss Air plane, which was the airline they used. Just as they hoped to break even, September 11th happened. And there are local problems too: 'Sometimes I feel like the filling in a sandwich – pressed from both sides. For example, there are frequent power-cuts, especially on Sundays, yet that is our busiest day!'

Polepole Bungalow resort has set up an organisation called MSAADA, the Mafia Island Sustainable Development Agency, whose acronym in Swahili, the local language, means 'help and solidarity'. MSAADA has been involved with the Committee of Utende school, providing assistance to the children of single-parent families and other community projects to which all guests who stay at the hotel are invited to contribute.

8.4. Chole Mjini Hotel

This hotel was set up as a result of the present owners, Jean and Ann de Villiers, being invited to the area by one of the marine biologists working with the Frontier³⁶ organisation. They found that the land around the ruins³⁷ had already been allocated for hotel development, and decided that they would get involved and try to create a hotel which would work in and for community development. Their financial partner Emerson Skenes³⁸ was insistent that the community benefits should materialise first, and so he put up a primary school and a clinic. Later the District Council took over the school. They first set up two local organisations: the Chole Development Society and the Chole Economic Development Society, but later also founded the Chole Women's Society, since the first two societies were run entirely by men. They also realised that in order to do what they wanted, namely to use the hotel to make money for community development, they would need to live on the site, so they moved there in 1997. Since then each hotel guest has contributed \$10 per day towards the development societies³⁹. There are thus three sets of 'stakeholders' –the donors, the villagers, and the hotel owners and managers (see De Villiers nd).

³⁶ Frontier: the society for environmental exploration, carried out a number of environmental surveys on Mafia in the 1990s. They produced numerous reports (see Horrill and Ngiole 1992, Mayers et al 1992)

³⁷ As already mentioned, Chole Mjini was previously the capital of the island during German times. It also had extensive Arab settlements which pre-dated the German ones.

³⁸ Skenes runs a hotel in Zanzibar: Emerson and Greens. I am grateful to him for granting me an interview and telling me about his involvement with the various community projects on Chole and the founding of the Chole Mjini Hotel.

³⁹ Funding for the Women's Society came from a Norwegian women's organisation FOKUS: The Norwegian Women's Front.

The owners told me that the hotel was built entirely by local people, except for two German volunteers who trained people in stone masonry and carpentry. They obtained all their wood from the Rufiji and Kilwa, but through local traders. Everything was built by hand, using no machine tools, because this gave jobs to local people. They have also recruited all of their staff from Chole island, and trained them on the job.

I asked about the conception of the hotel which has no electricity or flush toilets and where the rooms are built as tree houses: 'It's something different, its romanticised and nostalgic, which is a complete contradiction, given that we are trying to bring development.' But in a *Sunday Times* list of the 50 most extraordinary hotels in the world, Chole Mjini came in at number seven.

8.5. Lizu Hotel

This guest house in Kilindoni caters mainly for local residents, and is often used for official functions, as it has a large meeting hall. The owner is a Tanzanian woman who came to the island many years ago when her husband went to work there; she now considers herself a Mafian.

8.6. Harbour View Hotel

This is a small hotel located next to the harbour in Kilindoni. It was built by the then Mafia MP in 2001, and is run largely by his adult children. It attracts a regular clientele of senior government servants to its pleasant outdoor bar, and visiting officials often stay there.

8.7. What do hotels contribute to the local economy?

There were three questions I tried to ask of all hotels:

- Where did they source their supplies – locally or from outside?
- Were their staff from Mafia or elsewhere?
- What contribution if any had they made to the local community?

All the Utende/Chole hotels claimed that they bought some local produce, either from local people (especially fish) or from Kilindoni. The amounts varied considerably between the hotels, but it was clear that much of the food and drink was brought in from Dar es Salaam, and some of it had been imported into the country.

The same hotels all claimed to employ at least some people from Mafia, indeed, two of them made a special point of emphasizing that they had done so as a matter of principle. They noted that this policy meant a lot more training work for managers, but argued that not only were they contributing to the local economy, but that local people would make up in willingness what they lacked in sophistication. One manager who employed mainly local primary school leavers said: 'The Swahili have such generous and hospitable natures that they know how to treat guests'. Another manager remarked: 'There is a trade-off in efficiency for friendliness and personality. The guests react well to that. We send

staff with guests who want to visit the village. They make sure that they are properly dressed and even provide loincloths (*shuka*) for them to cover themselves’.

The two hotels which employed mainly local people were also heavily involved with the local community. Chole Mjini, in addition to setting up the three development organisations already mentioned, had built a school, a nursery, a clinic, and a marketplace, and trained local people in a variety of ways (see De Villiers nd). Polepole had assisted with the building and running of a new school for Utende village, and had also set up a women’s group. Local residents in the area are well aware of who has done what for them, and are very appreciative of the assistance given.

8.8. Projected hotel plans on Mafia

It was clear from interviews with existing hotel owners and with the Land Office in Kilindoni that a number of sites had either been sold or earmarked for tourist development. These included not only several around the Utende area, but also in the north of the island, outside the confines of MIMP. Two such are in the village of Kanga.

During my visit in 1994, I had heard that an Italian company wanted to buy the land behind the beach known as Msikitini, just north of Kanga village. This is an area where there are the remains of two German-built stone houses and a large building which was reported to have been a German cattle-shed, all of which were subsequently used by an Arab land-owner. Shortly after my return to the UK, I received a copy of the company’s brochure⁴⁰:

The sea area facing which the Lodge will be constructed is outside the Marine Park, for which reason it will be possible to go on fishing trips, which is not permitted in the Park,

It is stated that the hotel itself is to be constructed in part by rebuilding the existing ruins and in part by constructing 30 bungalows ‘which respect the most advanced principles of eco-tourism, are made from local materials, spread out over a huge area with great scenic value, with a minimal impact on the location’. The main building, or Club House, ‘constructed, like all the other buildings, with local materials and in local style’, is shown as a series of inter-linked round thatched huts⁴¹. After extolling the beauties of the area and the island as a whole, with its coral reefs, the brochure goes on to state that there will be a swimming pool, tennis and squash courts, sports massage, hairdresser. Inside the restored big ‘Arab-colonial’ building, a piano will be played for guests: ‘Everything will be in keeping with local tradition’ and ‘the staff will be dressed in tropical traditional style’.

⁴⁰ The brochure is written in Italian and I have translated sections

⁴¹ Round huts are not found anywhere on the coast, where Swahili-style houses are rectangular, with rooms off a central passage running from the front verandah to the courtyard at the back.

In order to build this hotel, it was first necessary to acquire the land, which is planted with coconut trees. The Italians were introduced to the area by the then MP. A local resident takes up the story:

They came in 1997 and started surveying without any warning or so much as a by-your-leave (*bila hodi*). Is that the way to do things? They were Europeans and they came in a Land Rover. The DC at that time...said that he would come – he did so, and he said that the government had already allocated this land [for development] in 1991. We said that no information [about this decision] had been received from anyone. The Chair of the Village Government and the Diwan were both present at this meeting. We were told ‘This place has already been deemed suitable’ (*mahali hapa kishapendekezwa*) [for tourist development] so we must sell.

We said we wouldn’t sell without knowing the price and we discussed a price of T. Sh. 50,000 per tree for coconut palms, and other trees such as mangoes etc should be sold at the government price. So we all agreed to the sale and the witness to the agreement was the [then] DC. Then the buyers began to count the coconut trees. The next day, they divided the land into two halves and said they would only pay 20,000 per tree for the whole lot, or 50,000 if they only took half of the land. So some people agreed to sell their coconut trees for 20,000 each.

Five people refused – three of those who had land around the ruins and two in the middle. The rest took the money, but these two sets of owners have not done so. They took the case further to Kibaha, capital of the Coast Region, and to Dar to the Land Court of the Region. All five who did not wish to sell signed the letter and sent copies to the Land office and to the DC. This was in 1998.

Then this year (2002) the Europeans came again. Even the fields around the ruins which had not yet been sold were cleared.

Q. So are the ruins their property or that of the government?

We don’t know. ... The DC came and he told us ‘Why are you resisting these investors? You’ll have to sell in the end, so it is better you do so now’. We said ‘We are not objecting to investors but we want the agreed price, that is how we do business.’ He said the decision had already been made by the government and if we didn’t agree we’d be forced to do so and thus we’d be robbed. So some people did sell for 20,000 and noone got the 50,000 [originally promised]. But five people stood out... So the DC came again and said he had been put under pressure and threatened us with the police etc. He said we had to sell, he came with police (*askari*), the Land Officer, half of the *Boma* was there. We said ‘You can shoot us if you like, but we won’t sell at that price.’ So the DC left and there has been silence since then. And it took a long time for the money to be paid to those who had sold.

Then the son of the European [developer] came and said [to those who had refused to sell] ‘Why are you still here?’ They said ‘Because we haven’t sold’. He said ‘But we’ve already paid three times for this land!’ So he went away. They [the developers] are not using the law. They talk [only] to the leaders and they come to frighten us. They must have been given money, those leaders’.

I asked a number of people what the village would get in return for the building of the hotel. The following quote is typical of their responses:

They said a clinic and school in both Bweni and Kanga, but you know how it is – when people want something they say anything – later, who knows? Maybe most of what the Italians say is true, but we've seen example in Zanzibar where lots were promised by French and South African developers and nothing happened.

Q. So what benefits will the locals get?

They say it will be employment. They will improve the road and there will be more traffic. They will buy local products. They will have four speed boats to take people diving and one to go to Dar to get stuff they need. The owner - wants to attract tourists who will want to go around and visit (*kutembea*) the locals in the villages.

Q. But maybe local people won't want to have tourists traipsing around?

Yes, there will be disadvantages to the whole scheme.

Q. What about beach boys (*mapaparasii*⁴²) – the kind who follow tourists and supply them with drugs and prostitutes?

I have to say that from what I can tell they [the developers] look like the kind of people who can do whatever they want. They already own three hotels [elsewhere in Tanzania]...

A number of villagers made similar points – much had been promised, but nothing had been forthcoming, and most did not expect anything to happen for their benefit.

The second site is located in the old coconut plantations which are in the south of the village next to the main Kanga beach. At the end of the beach is a peninsula next to a river mouth, where water is always available even when the tide is low. Here the land has been bought by a French developer. Once again, some people had held out against the sale:

Q. What do you think about the hotel plans?

We'll be told to move, to get over into the bush – and haven't we already sold our land? Where will we get sea cucumbers (*majongoo*)? Where will be put our vessels? They won't let us use the shore.

Q. But didn't you ask about that?

Yes, even before we sold. And in Rasini they said we could still keep the coconut trees and they would build a school and help with the clinic. But until today, where are they?

Q. Didn't some people refuse to sell their land?

Yes, people in Rasini only got 7,000 per tree, whereas the Msikitini people got 20,000 per tree. And in Bweni they sold for an even higher price – 60-70K per tree, a place called Banja of about one acre, although part of that area doesn't have any trees.

Q. Have you yourself see any tourist hotels?

Yes, in Zanzibar. They are OK for people with money, they aren't for people like us.

Others had sold but regretted it subsequently:

They persuaded, they pushed. Finally I agreed to sell for 7,000 per tree. They said that anyway the land belongs to the government, only the trees are ours. And I thought 'I could use the money'. But now it's gone.

⁴² The Swahili word comes from the Italian '*paparazzo/i*' meaning an intrusive and unscrupulous photographer. On the Kenyan coast many tourists are Italian and in towns such as Malindi Italian words have entered Swahili vocabulary (See Beckerleg 2003).

I asked villagers if hotels would bring other benefits in the form of development or employment – here is a sample of the answers I received:

Interview 1

Noone will get any profit. You need at least Standard 12 to get a job - so how many will get jobs there? Europeans will come with their own rules – they won't put local people there. They will be the ones to profit. Those who have sold have lost out, both in terms of price and their property.

Interview 2

No good thing will come out of it! (*Faida hakuna!*) (emphatically). I can't see that the locals in Utende get much out of the tourism there.

Q. Will people get work?

No you need to be educated to a high level. I am worried that our local customs will be spoiled (*desturi za mji zitavunjika*)... [Also] They will put their stuff there [on the beach] and you can't mix their things and ours. In the southern part of Mafia, you can't leave possessions around, from Kironwe southwards, things get stolen, even hens. The customs have changed here (*Desturi za hapa zimebadilika*).

Interview 3

Q. What about after the hotels are built?

They will impose their own rules. They will tell us not to use the beach, not to make any noise...

Q. Have you heard of this happening elsewhere?

Yes, in Utende

Q. So don't you think you'll get any profit out of this? What about selling things [to the hotels]?

They will mainly get what they need from Dar, they will only buy a bit from us.

Interview 4.

A. We will go even further backwards. All our customs (*mila*) will be destroyed. The civilized Europeans were the British but now all sorts [of other Europeans] have come in. You won't be able to go to the beach. Women will be raped. And they will get you up in court and use money to ensure that you are found guilty. It's already happened in Utende! Here we have really been dealt a blow.

Q. Why did people sell their land?

A. Because of need (*uhitaji*) and because they had no brains (*akili*)... [They were told] 'You will get employment', but of course [those saying that] were in the middle and got money from the sale. And they (buyers) promised to build a school and clinic. It's going to kill us!

It was not only older people who were against the idea of a hotel – some of the young people also saw that it might lead to problems.

Interview 5. Two youths

What do you think of the hotel plans? Will the villagers profit from them?

A. I don't really think we'll get much – a bit might go to the village council. But they aren't likely to take on uneducated people. They'll want people who have done hotel management.

T. The outcome might be worse – they might stop people using the beach!

A. At the beginning they said they would build the school and clinic. But nothing has happened! We hear that at Chole Mjini they did do things like a school and dispensary.

Only a small number of villagers were in favour

Interview 6.

Blessing will come from it – people will get work, the people will profit. Whenever white people and rich people come, there is bound to be work.

Some saw both advantages and disadvantages:

Interview 7.

There are two possibilities – good and bad. One is that armed robbers (*majambazi*) will come in. So there will be both blessing and trouble (*shari*). They will build it up and all sorts of people will come who might ‘break our houses’ (i.e. commit adultery). Those people who will come are different from us so things are bound to change.

But even some of those who spoke favourably were ambivalent:

Interview 8.

What do you think of the hotel plans?

Local people will get employment, there will be a *kiwanda* (lit. ‘factory’ or ‘workshop’), work.

But even this last informant soon changed his tune. We began to talk about Zanzibar, which he knew well, and I asked him about tourism there.

There is a village called Kendwa where the local people broke down a jetty built by the tourist hotel because they had stopped people from using the beach. And it will be the same here – people with black skins are thought to be thieves.

In short, then, the fears of local people could be summarised thus:

- developers will not fulfil their promises to give assistance
- once land has been sold it cannot be taken back, and people have lost both their capital assets and their birthright
- local people will not get work because they are not educated enough, or they will only get low-level work
- they will be denied access to the beach, which is their workplace
- hotels will not buy local produce, but obtain everything from Dar es Salaam
- sexual mores will be threatened
- tourists will walk around dressed improperly (*ovyoo*)
- the local culture will change and be damaged

Many local people had seen hotels not only in Utende, but also in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar and were well aware of what might happen with regard to a number of issues. However, there was little awareness of other issues which have arisen in tourist developments, particularly competition with local needs for water

resources, (especially if hotels build swimming pools) and disposal of waste, including sewage⁴³.

The other issue was the way in which they felt that they had been leaned upon to sell their land and trees. Not only had their poverty been taken advantage of, but developers had not kept to their agreements about prices, nor fulfilled their promises with regard to assistance to the village. People feel that they are not consulted, not kept informed, but made vague promises which they suspect will not be honoured.

Ironically, in view of the considerable assistance extended to the local communities by Chole Mjini and Polepole, people in the north of Mafia were much more likely to quote the example of one hotel which they claimed had closed beach access to local people, and about the hotels' complaints about noise⁴⁴.

8.9. Discussion and summary

If we consider only the hotels which are currently in existence, we can see that there is a wide variation in their involvement with the local community, and the extent to which it benefits from their existence. Utende has benefited from assistance with its primary school, Chole has had a great deal more help, including school, market, clinic, training, and the setting up of development groups.

The case of the proposed hotels in Kanga is somewhat different. Local people may have sold their land to developers, but all agree that they were driven to do so by poverty. Further, hardly anyone believes that developers will either give what has been promised to the village, or that the village will benefit economically or in other ways. On the contrary, most people cite the negative instances of the impact of tourism in other areas which they have either seen themselves or heard about. They also believe that local intermediaries have benefited from the sales and thus pressurised them into selling.

9.0. Fishing, fish processing and prawn farming

In this section I discuss fishing on Mafia as a whole, as I have already mentioned the contribution of fishing to the economy of Kanga and Bweni villages. Fishing has become increasingly important over the nearly forty years I have been observing it. It not only provides a living for a higher proportion of the local population, but the waters around Mafia also attract fishers from outside the area. In this section, I first discuss the Marine Park, set up to protect marine resources, and then go on to consider more intensive forms of fishing, the new fish processing plant, and the proposal to set up prawn farming on the island.

⁴³ In the MIMP General Management Plan, it is noted that any increase in tourist facilities in the Utende area is likely to lead to water shortages.

⁴⁴ The MIMP Management plan notes that in Utende there has been friction with local residents over land acquisition and access rights, as well as disturbance of visitors by beach-boys and by noise in neighbouring houses and bars (2000: 25).

9.1. Mafia Island Marine Park

It was because of the increasing pressure on marine resources both in terms of actual numbers of people and also the kind of gear that they used that the Mafia Island Marine Park was gazetted in 1995. The most unsustainable form of fishing was with dynamite, a practice which destroyed the coral reefs.

The Marine Park (MIMP) has been the subject of a number of theses and reports⁴⁵, and I do not propose to discuss it in detail. Rather, I am interested in people's perceptions of it. I begin with some of the employees.

9.1.1. The views of the Park staff

The Park staff explained that there are some 7-8,000 people dependent on fishing on Mafia, and that half of the fish sold at the market in Dar es Salaam comes from Mafian waters. MIMP's purpose is that of conservation of the marine environment by reducing pressure on resources. In order to fulfil this remit, it has been involved in helping set up alternative sources of livelihood for people living in the park, in giving advice on sustainable fishing gear (and actually assisting in providing it in some instances), in providing micro-credit and generally getting involved in local development.

The main aim is to reduce pressure on marine resources so as to give alternative sources of income. We want sustainable mariculture, fish caging (*kufuga samaki*), *mwani* (seaweed farming - this has been successful on Jibondo), lime-making using dead (not live) corals, bee-keeping, mats, making coconut fibre door mats. We give training, and increase awareness, and now there is a soft loan scheme which has started. We are trying to stop destructive practices such as the use of beach seine nets (Warden, interview 210602).

MIMP is funded by levies on outsiders entering the park (US\$10 per diem), on a small amount from the Tanzanian government, and on grants from the World Wildlife Fund (WWF), NORAD and the UK Department for International Development (DfID).

I was able to interview the Warden, the Technical Advisor, and the Micro-Credit Officer. They explained that the MIMP is currently in Phase One, during which they have built headquarters in Utende, and hired thirty staff. They were successful, with their patrol boats, in eradicating dynamite fishing. The Warden and the Technical Officer see themselves as scientists, not politicians, yet they are well aware that even before its inception, the Marine Park was heavily involved in politics at both the local, national and even international level (see Andrews 1999, Walley 1999).

The Micro-credit officer explained that he had just arrived on the island to set up a credit and a savings and investment scheme. After carrying out a survey, it was decided that it should be a village-based scheme with a loan from WWF.

⁴⁵ See Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism 2000, Walley 1999, Chando 2001, Andrews 1999.

Alongside the credit facilities a savings and investment company was established, so that people could save at the same time. The credit was usually given to set up a small business such as buying dried fish, starting a tea stall, or to pay domestic needs such as secondary school fees, buying seeds, or hospital fees.

I asked the two senior officers what they thought were the problems of the Park:

- Locals do want to continue fishing in restricted areas- they argue that the eradication of dynamite fishing has been successful so there are now more fish. Younger fishermen are particularly resistant to the conservation rules and are unlikely to attend consultation meetings.
- There are middlemen who come with nets from Dar and give these to locals, who repay by providing them with fish. The middlemen make big profits, but the locals, who are badly paid for their catches, fish more in order to make ends meet.
- The same is true of the TANPESCA⁴⁶, fish processing company whose factory buys a lot of local fish (see below section 9).
- There are lots of proposed developments on Mafia, some of them even in the Marine Park, and no attempt to do the Environment Impact Assessments required by law.
- Some of the hotels have been reluctant to support the \$10 entry fee to the Park
- In any case we don't get enough tourists coming here – even the hotels we have only get a 30% occupancy rate – and the low numbers means that we get fewer flights to the island.
- We have outside funds now, but from 2004 we will need to generate some of our own funds
- We get involved in politics, even though we don't want to. We are people of science (*watu wa sayansi*) not of politics (*watu wa siasa*).
- The low level of education on Mafia

At the same time, the Park had achieved a great deal:

- laying out a Management Plan
- working out a zoning plan
- developing internal procedures
- recruiting three quarters of the planned staff.
- assisting with social welfare such as schools, wells

The Technical Advisor talked about alternatives to fishing:

- bee-keeping
- handicrafts – here part of the problem is getting them to market, another is quality
- seaweed cultivation – this has been moderately successful
- raising chickens – here the main problem is an endemic disease; the only remedy would be vaccinating them

⁴⁶ TANPESCA is part of the Alpha Group, which has fishing and shipping interests in Uganda and Kenya as well as Tanzania see www.alphaafrica.com.

He also mentioned forthcoming projects such as fish cages in Juani, and pearl farming.

9.1.2. Some local views of the Marine Park

Here is the view of a middle-aged, educated Mafian:

The first issue is that they said that most people employed by the Marine Park would be Mafians, and that if qualified people were not available on Mafia, they would train people, but this has not happened. The majority of the Park employees are from outside.

Secondly, people thought that they would get improved fishing gear from the park, including boats. This would have enabled them to fish further afield, outside the protected zone. But this did not happen.

Third, the original designated area of the Park has been extended right up to Bweni (in the north). The Park seems to spread every day! The reason for the trouble in Jibondo!⁴⁷ was that MIMP had put its buoys in areas which had not previously been agreed. This led to the police arresting people and seizing gear.

Finally, I don't think the Park is doing enough to get people on side. People on Mafia generally do not understand the importance of the Park and I don't think they are being properly informed. Only the workers are taught what it is about. This needs rectifying.

Unfortunately, I had this interview after I had left the Park, so was not able to discuss these issues with the Park Officers. However, it was clear from my interviews with them that they were well aware of differences of opinion: 'In some areas we are popular, but not in others (Warden). 'There are too many perceptions, of which ours is only one' (Technical Advisor). My guess is that they would say that they had employed as many local people as possible but it had been necessary to fill posts quickly in order to get the project up and running and work within the time-scales of both their plans and their funding. They would probably also argue that they did not have funds to provide local fishermen with boats and improved gear. In fact some of the advice they gave was actually to revive some of the traditional gear, such as basket traps (*madema*), but young people did not know how to make them and were not interested in learning.

The question of which zone had been designated when, and what had been agreed to by local people was a constant source of contention. Some zones may not be fished at all, others only at certain times. And I was told by a number of informants that the Jibondo fishermen who had been arrested had only been sailing back through a designated area with their catch from outside when the police caught them.

The question of 'getting people on side' is more difficult. MIMP does hold consultation meetings, and local people sit on various committees of the Park. However, almost all of the Park's documentation is written in English, and

⁴⁷ He was referring to the violence which broke out when Jibondo fishermen resisted arrest for allegedly fishing in protected waters.

although a Swahili version of the Management Plan was published, it was not widely circulated on the island. One northern villager to whom I showed the Swahili version said: 'How is it that you come here for a few weeks and you are given a copy of this plan, but we who live here did not even know of its existence?'

9.2. Fish processing

During my first visits to Mafia, there was a small factory in Kilindoni known as Hellas which bought octopus (*pweza*) from local fishermen and processed it for export. By 2002, this factory had been bought by a new company, TANPESCA, which considerably enlarged and modernised the plant. TANPESCA started purchasing all kinds of fin-fish and crustaceans, as well as octopus and squid. They offered nets and outboard motors to local fishermen who repaid the loans by selling their catches to the company.

9.2.1. The views of factory management

I visited the brand-new factory on 10/7/02 and, after donning protective clothing, was shown around by some of the senior employees. I was told that the company was particularly interested in shrimp, octopus, crab, squid and lobster, all of which they process on the spot for export. The processed material goes in their refrigerated ship to Dar es Salaam and is then put into container ships bound mainly for Europe. About half of the material processed is bought from local artisanal fishermen, and half comes from the company's own fishing vessels which work off the Tanzanian coast focusing particularly on prawns.

By the time of my visit in July 2002, the factory was employing 200 people full and part-time, of whom about a third were from outside of Mafia. Some of the senior management were from India (mostly Kerala) which has a long-established prawn fishing industry.

9.2.2. The views of fishermen and an employee

I spoke to a few fishermen about the advantages and disadvantages of selling to the factory. Some of them said that the major problem was being told to come back and collect money later ('the previous company always paid you on the spot') and many complained about the low prices offered.

I interviewed one local woman who worked in the processing plant. She told me that she did long shifts for very low rates of pay and only worked when there was material available for processing. 'We get 1500/- for a twelve hour day or night shift, and we don't get breaks, apart from one meal break. And we are hired as casual labourers, even though some of us have been there for more than three months [and under Tanzanian law should have their posts regularised].'

9.3 The proposed prawn farming project

In the 1990s, there was an abortive plan to set up what was said to be the world's largest prawn farm in the Rufiji Delt. This plan raised considerable

hostility from local people, from the Tanzanian Media, and from the Journalists' Environmental Team (JET) and the Lawyers Environmental Action Team (LEAT⁴⁸) and was eventually abandoned⁴⁹. Part of the reason for this hostility was the knowledge that this industry had wreaked considerable environmental destruction in Asia⁵⁰. After a number of years of campaigning, the company concerned, which had accrued considerable debts, sold its ships and pulled out⁵¹.

At the beginning of 2002, a company called Alphakrust Ltd, which has connections with both the aforementioned Alpha Group and the Tanpesca Company, applied to the authorities on Mafia Island for land to set up a 100 hectare shrimp farm on an inter-tidal salt flat (*jangwa*) in Jimbo village in northern Mafia. This caused considerable controversy on the island and the varying views of people involved in or affected by this project will now be considered

9.3.1. *The proposed project – the company's views*

In a covering letter sent with its initial application to the local authorities in January 2002, the company cited the benefits of prawn farming:

better utilization of unproductive and marginally productive coastal lands, intertidal areas, swamps, brackish water..[thereby] augmenting production for export and foreign exchange earning, support to [the] food security system, establishment of industries, generation and employment and improving socio-economic conditions... This project is estimated to serve almost every Jimbo resident by providing self-employment to the villagers, since we plan to educate them and finally offer free seeds for them... Also the district as a whole will be benefiting from the extra income generating from the product [by] collecting levy for the exported product.

In the application itself, the company anticipated some of the potential problems:

a) *Ecological imbalance connected with destruction of vegetation*

It is argued that this problem arises when there is complete removal of vegetation such as mangroves. However, it was admitted that 'in most sites, cutting of mangroves cannot be avoided. In such cases destruction should not be more than 50%' (Alpha Krust 2001).

b) *Environmental problems arising from effluents from the ponds.*

The company recognised that in both intensive and semi-intensive farming, there is a high risk of pollution of the surrounding area because of water containing effluent and fertiliser discharging from the ponds. However, it argued that they

⁴⁸ LEAT has its own website: www.lead.or.tz

⁴⁹ See Lissu 1999, LEAT 2002, Shrimp Sentinel Online, 1998, World Rainforest Movement Bulletins 1998, 2001, Mangrove Action Project 1997, www.ippmedia.com 2003, Ringia and Porter 1999, Stedman-Edwards n.d.

⁵⁰ See Environmental Justice Foundation 2003, Martinez-Alier 2001, Primavera 1998, Quarto nd.

⁵¹ The owner of the company, Reginald John Nolan, left Tanzania for Ireland. A report in www.ippmedia.com of 11th June 2003 stated: 'Nolan is on the run from justice... after defaulting on credit extended to his company known as African Fishing Company Ltd.'

would use semi-intensive culture with a lower stocking density, and would also provide a well-designed effluent treatment.

c) There would be a change in the land use patterns if waste water from the ponds were pumped onto adjoining agricultural land.

The company argued that this problem arises if the waste water mixes with pesticides as happens elsewhere, but that as local agriculture is non-intensive, it should not be a problem.

All in all, it was argued that this project was part of the aquaculture which Tanzania wished to promote, that it would be appropriate for it to receive subsidies from the government, that at least 50% of mangroves should be preserved, and that there should be discouragement of intensive prawn farming without a well-designed EIP (Environmental Impact Plan).

In a second document, a technical feasibility study (Alphakrust 2002), the company argued as follows:

- the demand for shrimps is increasing
- it could profit from the experiences and mistakes made by Asian countries
- the east coast of Africa, and Mafia in particular, has 'huge potential as an ideal place for farming Black Tiger Shrimps in the African continent' (p. 3.)
- that the site selected at Jimbo is ideal in terms of temperature, rainfall and the pristine quality and calmness of the sea
- that they would begin with a pilot project and would utilise the relevant Codes of Conduct⁵² for responsible aquaculture.

One of the technicians from Kerala told me:

In Kerala many families depend on prawn farming, and our plan is not only to have a large farm but also many small ones. Mafia has to develop - there is nothing here now. This is going to bring development on a large scale. The (Tanpesca) factory already provides work for many people and the prawn farm will provide much more. There has been a lot of politics involved in this, and one scheme has already foundered, but a lot of money has been spent on this and we are determined to succeed. I have heard there is a bit of local opposition but that is because people don't understand. Contrary to rumour, we are not going to cut mangroves either. I am an experienced technician. I have worked in many places and know what I am doing. We want it to be eco-friendly.

At a meeting in Dar I attended which included senior people in the company, the following points were made:

- The company had already spent 6 months talking to people in Tanzania, and they couldn't deal with each individual
- Tanpesca has already made a big difference on Mafia and done a fantastic job – it spends Sh. 8-10 million per week buying fish and already employs one hundred people

⁵² e.g. FAO's *Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries* which includes a section on aquaculture. See www.fao.org/fi/agreem/condecond/ficond.asp. There are various national Codes of Conduct for sustainable aquaculture, including one of the Global Aquaculture Alliance (www.gaalliance.org)

- There will be jobs for 200 people from this project
- Every kilo of prawns will give a levy of 200/- to the District Council – so it's going to be a lot of money for them
- We visited the site in Jimbo and they [local people] seemed quite happy

Another pointed out that the Mafia scheme is part of a plan which will involve other areas of the coast with material coming from Rufiji, Mafia and further afield. They see these projects as part of development: 'We don't want to use force, we want to help, especially in health and education. We are making desks for schools, we've already sent them footballs.'

A third said as follows: 'This area [Mafia] shouldn't be called backward, because there is plenty here. If you look at the economy you see agricultural products going down in price, but fish has come up [in price] and provides an income... If we can make this technology work by teaching people to set up artisanal units of 1-2 hectares, using natural resources and the manpower they have, it could spread development widely.'

9.3.2. *The views of government officials*

An important factor here is the current climate in Tanzania, in which the official policy is to welcome outside investment as a way of developing the country. In any case, most permissions for projects of this kind are initially sought at the top, not at the local level. It is thus very difficult for local officials, even if they disagree with a particular project, to oppose it if it has already been agreed in principle in Ministries in Dar es Salaam.

Most government officials recognise the poverty of Mafia, which is bad even by Tanzanian standards, and bemoan the lack of any sign of development on the island. Senior officials have been given targets to meet, and it was clear that some of them saw the proposed prawn farm, along with the development of the Tanpesca factory, as a major way of bringing development to the island quickly. They talked, for example, of the jetty construction which was promised by Tanpesca/Alphakrust and which would mean that large vessels could dock at Kilindoni, instead of having to anchor at sea.

In an article in *Mtanzania* of June 14th 2002, the District Commissioner was reported as saying as follows:

Since the opening of the fish processing factory which happened a few months ago on the island of Mafia, in the Coast Region, the inhabitants have gained between 5 and 8 million shillings a day⁵³... Mr. Alli Libaba [the DC] said that this factory, which was started by a local company called TANPESCA, would enable the people of this island, who number around 50,000, to pull themselves out of poverty.

Libaba said that besides this [expenditure] the company had loaned to local fishermen nets worth Sh. 44 million. The DC of Mafia said that the purpose of this

⁵³ It will be noted that a company representative quoted this as a weekly, not daily figure in the meeting I attended (see previous page)

loan was to enable the fishermen to fish knowing that they would be able to sell to this factory, which had thus improved the economy of the island (p. 5.)

Senior officials in the Boma were thus taken aback by the strength of local opposition, which came both from the villagers and from the Mafia District Council, as well as by the fact that the villagers complained to the National Environmental Management Council (NEMC), which responded by suspending the project pending further investigations. Some officials also felt that they should have been better briefed about the pros and cons of prawn farming.

9.3.3. *The views of MIMP*

Although the new factory was situated outside the Marine Park, the latter's officials had already had dealings with its manager. Before the factory became operational, it relied for the processing of fish on a barge which had originally been moored within the Park. After MIMP complained about the environmental impact of the waste from the barge and pointed out that it was illegal⁵⁴ for it to operate there, it was moved outside the confines of the Park⁵⁵.

Neither the Park Warden nor the Technical Assistant Officer had initially been involved in the proposed prawn farming project, as both the site in Jimbo and the hatchery in Kilindoni were outside of the Marine Park. The Warden told me about the failure of the plans for prawn farming in Rufiji, which he said had happened because of local opposition, but which he saw as being reincarnated on Mafia:

The Jimbo villagers were told by the leaders that it would be economically viable, and the District Council and the Coast Region earmarked land. However, legally, if they (developers) want more than a certain amount, they have to go to the local people and ask if they agree. At first people did agree, but then they refused for a number of reasons. One was that we had sent them guidelines and told them that an EIA (Environmental Impact Assessment) was needed. Another was that they heard that the Rufiji people had refused to have a prawn farm and they thought there must be a good reason. Thirdly, people don't know what compensation they will get and they want to know. Yet this project got political support because there are different schools of thought on the matter.

Eventually the views of MIMP were sought by a range of parties, including the company, the District Administration, the District Council and the villagers, because they were the only people with sufficient technical information.

⁵⁴ Section 13 of the Marine Parks and Reserves Act of 1994 states: 'Except as specified under this Act, no activity shall be permitted, and no right, licence, title, interest, franchise, lease, claim, privilege, exception, or immunity shall be granted to any person or entity, by any person, agency or entity, whether government or private, in any area that has been declared as a marine park or marine reserve pursuant to this Act, unless such grant is consistent with the general management plan and regulations, and there is an express permission of the Warden, or the Unit Manager, as the case may be.'

⁵⁵ See report by Tanga Mohamed in *The East African*, August 3-9, 1998: www.nationaudio.com/News/East African/0308/Maritime/MA11.html.

9.3.4. *The views of the Mafia District Council and a local NGO*

I spoke to one Councillor (*Diwan*)

Originally the village leaders in Jimbo had agreed to the prawn farming plan. But then a meeting of the whole village refused, and sent a letter to NEMC (National Environmental Management Council), which suspended the project. The government administration on Mafia was not pleased, but sent it to be discussed by the District Land Committee. There one of the District Councillors asked a lot of questions, especially about profit and loss on this scheme, for which he was labelled a troublemaker. You see, there are laws which give local powers in theory, but in practice they do not.

An official of a local NGO was against the project because he feared that it would cause environmental damage and because local people had not been properly consulted. But he was blamed for some unfavourable reports which appeared in the Dar es Salaam newspapers: 'I was called in and put in the hot seat (*kiti moto*)'. I asked him if it wasn't good news that the farm was to be semi-intensive, not intensive, and he replied:

I doubt it. When a man comes to propose marriage, he says he will look after the woman nicely, but after a month you may find that he hits her, cuts her nose, does not buy her clothes. She does not eat or sleep well. It's exactly the same with this. They will say whatever is needed to get what they want.

9.3.5 *The view of local villagers*

Local villagers were opposed to the plan, and they were supported by people from all over the north of the island.

The big people of the District agreed to the sale of the salt-flat (*jangwa*) of Jimbo, but the people did not. Whose property is it anyway? It is village property. We have many uses for it: crabs for eating, poles for building, for example. We need it. And we have not had it [the plan] properly explained to us – they have not been open with us. We have been told that we should not impede development and investment. But maybe we should join the people of Jibondo [in resisting]! (Jimbo villager)

It could be a good idea, it could bring work and business. But their way of going about things (*utaratibu wao*) has been terrible. They have used force. They have only dealt with big people outside not with the villagers. We have been told nothing. So there hasn't yet been any agreement (Jimbo villager).

Concern was also expressed by villagers from further north who used the path through the salt-flat to get to Kirongwe on foot or by bicycle.

9.3.6. *The views of the consultants*

As a result of the halting of the project by NEMP, it was realised that a proper environmental assessment of the project should be made. The company appointed a team of consultants who came from Dar es Salaam and spent several days on the island before writing first an Interim 'Scoping' Report and

subsequently a full-scale Environmental Impact Assessment (ENATA 2003), as a result of which the Company obtained a 'conditional environmental clearance certificate'.

In the EIA document, it is stated that its purpose is to 'communicate to all the various stakeholders who will make decisions about the proposed project, namely project developers and the investors, regulators and planners... (p. 3.). It is explained that Mafia was chosen because of its ideal environmental conditions, the support of the local [District] authorities, and the conducive investment climate in Tanzania.

The Report recognises that socio-economic, ecological, cultural and environmental issues are raised by this proposal. Potential disadvantages of the scheme brought up by local people ⁵⁶are recognised by the developers and these include the following:

- permanent loss of source of whelks and bivalves (*tondo* and *chaza*) and of some mangroves
- the closure of public footpaths and access to the local 'harbour' (*bandari*) at Panyani)
- the risk of further deterioration of the road from Kilindoni to Kirongwe as a result of the heavy plant which will need to traverse it in the course of construction of the farm
- the further stretching of social services, including health services
- the social and cultural impact of a large number of non-Mafian workers

The Report argues, however, that the losses to be incurred by local people will be far outweighed by the gains both locally and nationally, in terms of employment, income, and the possibility of artisanal prawn farming becoming a major source of livelihood in the area. It also includes a mitigation plan to lessen some of the negative impacts of the prawn farm. These include:

- careful monitoring of the environment at regular intervals
- some additional health services to be provided by the investor
- outside workers to be sensitised to local customs

However, there remains a number of issues which are not addressed:

- the proposal that there should be some material benefits to the local community is not spelled out (other than a mention of footpaths and desks already provided)
- the promise of alternative pathways is somewhat vague: they are to be provided 'when and where possible'
- the promise to observe the weight limits of road bridges does not get over the problem of further deterioration of an already bad road and who is to pay for its repair

⁵⁶ Meetings were held with local residents, with District Officials, with District Councillors, and with MIMP. The Report acknowledges frankly that the developer's proposals were well-received at the high District level, with mixed responses at the District Council level, and with scepticism at the village level (p. 36).

- there is no mention of a mechanism by which local people can have their concerns addressed on a regular basis as first the construction and then operation of the farm proceed

Most importantly, the question of the monitoring of the project focuses largely upon the environment, while its impact on local economic and social life receives much less mention. The EIA proposes that there should be an environment management team consisting of project employees, member of the District Council, NEMC, and representatives of the Ministries of Forestry and Fisheries and of the Marine Park, but there is no mention of local villagers. Furthermore, the suggestion is that the economic and cultural impact of the farm should be reviewed only every two years. It would surely be preferable for reviews to be held more frequently. Indeed, a full-scale study of the economic and social impact of the farm upon the local village, division, and island as a whole, might be carried out, perhaps by a Ph.D. student.

9.4. Summary and Discussion

The plan to farm prawns commercially raises a number of important issues:

- the level of consultation with local people, especially in advance of the scoping report and of the construction of the prawn farm hatchery
- the amount of information available to local stakeholders, including government officials, and in particular the paucity of information in Swahili
- the impact on the environment, both in the short and long term (e.g. cutting mangroves, pollution from effluent)
- loss of land rights to local people
- whether advantages to local people outweigh disadvantages

Mafians may be regarded by some as backward and ignorant, but they are well aware that their neighbours in the Rufiji saw off a similar plan, and that there were good reasons for so doing. For villagers to have got themselves sufficiently organised to have protested at all levels of the political system, including writing to the NEMC is quite unusual. But virtually all the villagers to whom I spoke were convinced that the decision had already been made at the top and that their voices would count for very little.

10. Risk and Danger: local perceptions

What do people see as the main risks in their lives? In this section I consider four issues: increasing poverty and lack of food security, illness, including HIV/AIDS, exclusion from development and loss of existing rights. Permeating all of these is a discourse concerning the issue of corruption (*rushwa*)

10.1. Food security

This project began with an interest in local perceptions of modernity, to be accessed particularly through perceptions of food security. It rapidly became apparent, however, that a consideration of food security involves a wide range of

other issues: means of earning cash, health, fertility, government policies, educational opportunities.

Most people in the village argued that they had less security now than previously. This was because food prices had risen, while ability to earn money through the sale of cash crops had fallen considerably. People were also unhappy about the kind of food which they are now being encouraged to grow and eat (bananas and cassava for example) or are forced to buy because it is cheaper (imported rice).

At the same time, because of the numerous campaigns both locally and nationally, people are more aware than ever before of the importance of eating well and of giving their children healthy food.

10.2. *Illness*

In Kanga village, they are proud of their new clinic and their own part in its building; they speak highly of their clinic paramedic and his hard work; they are very pleased that their children are now vaccinated and that women can give birth in the clinic.

At the same time, people are concerned about illness not just for themselves or their children, but about its implications: how will they manage? How will they find the necessary cash to make the long journey to the district hospital, and once there, to pay for consultations and medicines?

Yet they recognise that part of their health problems come from poverty, particularly the inability for many to obtain not only a healthy and balanced diet, but even sufficient food to fill the stomach; it also comes from over-work, especially that of women.

There is growing concern about AIDS, and I found little evidence that this issue is being ignored, especially on the part of women, who feel that they are vulnerable to infection from husbands who have liaisons away from the village. Some of them have begun to be active in the clinic and women's groups and are discussing such matters more openly than before.

10.3. *Exclusion from development*

Many people at the village level bemoaned what they saw as the backward state of Mafia. When asked what development or progress (*maendeleo*) there had been since my last visit, most people said that there had been very little, if any at all, and that life had got considerably harder.

For people at the village level, education is a major problem. Although virtually all children now attend primary school, which means that most are now literate⁵⁷ very few go on to Secondary School, and even among those who do, there is a

⁵⁷ When I first visited Mafia in the 1960s, only some of the boys and a very small number of girls were in school, although many adults were literate in Swahili using the Arabic script (*Kiarabu*) they had learned in Koran school. The situation has improved, so that today most younger people are literate in Roman script (*Kizungu*).

high drop-out rate. So far none of the children of Kitomondo school has gone beyond Form Four. Some young people from Kanga have managed to take courses which have qualified them in a variety of professions, such as health workers, primary school teachers or village-level government officials but these are a small minority. Furthermore, courses which admitted primary school leavers a few years ago, now demand at least Form IV if not Form VI, which at present is beyond the reach of most villagers.

There is widespread recognition that for things to change for the better, education is vital. Mafians are excluded from the few existing job opportunities by their low levels of education, and this also means that it is more difficult for most villagers to participate in decision-making processes.

10.4. Loss of existing rights

People talked about the problems they saw particular kinds of development, such as the building of tourist hotels or prawn farms, more in terms of loss than gain. Such developments might involve the loss of access to land, whether it be a path over the salt flat, or use of the beach for numerous activities, as well as the loss of land itself through the sale of trees. At the same time, many people complain that their rights are being trampled upon by people higher up: they are disregarded and if they go to complain, they do not receive justice⁵⁸.

11.0. Trust and Blame: the view from below

One of the major aims of this project was to establish where people thought the responsibility for their lives lay, and in this section I consider ideas about the government (at several levels), political parties, NGOs and cooperative groups, households, families and kin networks, neighbours and individuals themselves.

11.1. The responsibility of the government

Many people at the village level felt that the government had a major responsibility for ensuring their well-being.

Interview 1.

Q. What is the work of government?

To push cultivation (*kuhimiza kilimo*) and to make sure that people respect the government (*kuhimiza watu waheshimu serikali*). To make sure that children are educated.

Interview 2

Q. What drives development? (*maendeleo*)

The government has to be involved. For instance, if people don't cultivate [they have to make them] - previously the Agricultural Officer used to come and tell people to plant crops [now he does not].

⁵⁸ It is scarcely surprising, then, that when the house of an elected official in Jimbo caught fire recently, it was widely believed that he was being punished for supporting the prawn farming scheme after being bought off.

Interview 3

Almost everyone is having a hard time – a hard life. There is no well-being, there are no gains to be had, only the ones who have businesses or shops [are better off]. We have really gone backwards.

Q. So whose fault is this?

A. This is partly the government's fault. [For example] They have allowed the importing of other cooking oils, and there is no longer a fixed price for coconuts.

Q. So what do you see as the government's responsibility?

A. To make sure that cultivation goes ahead.

Q. What difference do you see between different governments in Tanzania?

A. Things are worse now... [because they are] selling off things, company by company.

Q. Who buys them?

A. Outsiders, Europeans. Yet [local] people are having to pay for medicines. It would be better [for the government] to borrow than do that. You can't imagine how angry people are at having to find money for medicine. They [government] used to say that our taxes paid for that.

Q. So what do you think your tax does pay for?

A. I really don't know – they used to say it was for medicine... They are really planning badly - prices are going up and what we get is decreasing.

Interview 3.

The village government helps – you can go there with your troubles, but further up they just deceive you, if you don't have money, you will be 'eaten'.

Q. Have the different presidencies been different?

Things were cheaper and more available before, but recently, people are only lamenting (*wanasikitika*). Their policies are all over the place, they don't have any proper politics (*siasa*) they only deal with things up there (*mambo ya juujuu tu*).

Interview 4

Q. What do you think of free market policies?

The government should be like a kind of father who has to feel pity for his children [and look after them]. If you just leave it to others, they'll do whatever they like. So I don't like the current policies.

Q. What about the village government?

It's their job to ensure that people cultivate and fish. And to help with loans.

Interview 5

Q. Does the government help at all?

No it doesn't – if it had would we be in this state?

Q. Do you mean the national or local government?

The leaders from here should do something (*kushughulika*) about the state of things. But they have done nothing. They should be sending reports about it [to those higher up]. Things used to be better but now...! [Up there] They use our money as they like, they build their big houses.

Interview 5

Q. And how does the government come in?

The government has to come in. For example people were having to pay 2,000 fees p.a. for primary school, now they've stopped the payment of fees.

Interview 6

You see the state of things here. There is no one who has a couple of lakhs in their house. Poverty has really entered.

Q. So how do you manage?

We live, we pray

Q. And whose responsibility is that?

The main responsibility is that of the government

Q. So how do you think your taxes are spent?

We are told it is spent on the villages! But we only get bits and pieces!

Q. Do leaders come here to Kanga?

Yes, they do and they see what's going on but they don't actually DO anything.

Interview 7

Everyone has to want to improve their own lives, but the government has to come in as well. You need help, a foundation, something to start with...

Several things emerge from such interviews: the government is seen as operating at different levels. The village government tries to be helpful and is approachable, but there is a recognition that important matters are decided elsewhere. There is criticism of local leaders for apparent failure to 'do something', and particularly to communicate local problems to leaders higher up. There is criticism of the people at the top for policies which include selling off national assets, for not using taxes to the benefit of the villagers. There are also more specific criticisms for issues which affect local people:

- the government allowed the import of cooking oil, thereby lessening the market for coconut oil
- the government took away controlled pricing
- the government imposed charges for medical treatment [at the District level and beyond]

Yet at the same time, people recognised that it was the job of the authorities to ensure that they themselves fulfilled their responsibilities to cultivate and to fish, and to respect the government.

How did local officials see things? I asked a village official how problems could be forwarded to higher officials:

It goes to the village government, then to the Ward⁵⁹ Secretary (*Katibu Kata*), then to *Tarafa* (division)⁶⁰ then to the District – either to the Council or to the DED (District Executive Officer). It depends on what it's about – if it's serious enough it goes on to the government – to the Region and then the Central government. Things these days start at village level and go up, but formerly they came down from above.

At the same time, it was frequently argued that policies had changed – the government could not provide everything that people needed, they had to do a lot for themselves. Furthermore, planning was now supposed to come from below, not from above, as a senior government official on the island stated:

People have to realise they can't depend on the government anymore – they have to help themselves. So we don't give government loans any more – that just didn't work... We can request the government to give us extra assistance. For

⁵⁹ Wards often consist of more than one village. Kanga and Bweni together form a single ward.

⁶⁰ Mafia has two divisions: Kironawe and north, and the remainder of the island.

example, take a local school... The people build it themselves, but they ask for government help with materials and the District Council may also give something.

This policy was heard many times at both District and village level, as for instance from a community leader in Kilindoni:

In the old days, people were just recipients (*wapokeaji tu*) of things from the government, now we see people doing things for themselves. We have to encourage (*kuhimiza*) people with a community-based approach. There really is a big drive on now (*chango moto kubwa*)

Similarly in a village meeting:

Chair. Let me finish by saying that these days we have to start things ourselves, then the government will come in and help. For the government of today, we have to show our own efforts (*juhudi zetu wenyewe*) first.

Such a view is clearly in conflict with one in which the government is seen as being like a father who cares for his children.

11.2. Political Parties

Tanzania introduced a multiparty system in the early 1990s but the party which ruled before this time, the Chama cha Mapinduzi (CCM), remains in power. Although there are many registered parties in Tanzania, on Mafia the only other party which has attracted any support is the Civic United Front (CUF), which currently has one representative on the District Council.

I talked to officials in both parties at both village and district level. What had been the effect of multipartyism?

Village CCM official

In those days [of one-party rule], the CCM was alone, but now there are other parties, so if you don't keep your promises... And these days you have opposition people watching if you make mistakes...

Q. So what do you think the effects of multi-partyism have been?

If you have a monopoly, you can do as you like, but now the party has to keep to its promises.

2nd CCM official

What do you think of multipartyism?

It's true that under a single party system we lived peacefully, but there were still people who scorned respect it (*kudharau*). So the government started multipartyism as a kind of test and so that people could join other parties [if they wanted to].

Q. And how do you think things have turned out?

I think they have improved – we have a much better clinic than we did before. And if we (officials) go to a meeting in Kilindoni, the government sends a Land Rover, not like the old days when all we got was the lorry which carries stones!

Q. Do you think it has brought quarrels?

Yes, especially in Zanzibar and Pemba and Dar. But here (on Mafia) it is only jokes and ribbing in football matches. Many people joined CUF thinking they

would get something (*posho*). And they were indeed bought, but when they saw they would get nothing... [they left]

CUF official

So what are the advantages of multi-partyism?

The CCM caused a lot of strife (*imeteteka sana*). [For example] They didn't want khangas to come from Zanzibar. When people bought them there they had to wash them in water first [before returning to make them appear used]. Now they don't have to bother.

CCM District official

Q. What effect has multipartyism had?

Both CCM and CUF are here, but there is no quarrelling as you get in places like DSM – no quarrelling. People do come here to Mafia from DSM and Zanzibar and stir things up sometimes but once they go things return to normal. Only one village [on Mafia] has a CUF person [on the District Council].

So the party line on both sides was to stress that the presence of more than one party had not led to any problems, a view which was also reflected at the villager level:

CUF Village official

Q. Have there been any problems between CCM and CUF??

No not here, and there is nothing on the mainland only in Zanzibar and Pemba.

Q. How did CUF do on Mafia in the 2001 (parliamentary) election?

The candidate didn't get many votes.

CUF supporter

CUF has been good and a lot of people have joined including myself. Since then the CCM has quietened down – they know they might lose elections in the future.

Q. What are the differences between the two parties?

The CCM is in government. CUF is still just a political party. It says that the CCM is deceiving us and that they will do better. We don't know if they will – after all, if you come for a loan you speak nicely until you get it.

The consensus at the village level seemed to be that people could choose where to put their allegiance, but it was not an issue, and that multipartyism had meant that the ruling party had to ensure that they kept their word. Even so, there was some scepticism that a change of government would really mean a change of policy.

11.3. NGOs and cooperative groups (*vikundi*)

The rise in the number of NGOs, both local and international, has been dramatic. To some extent, this has been encouraged by government policies which have sought assistance wherever it might be forthcoming, in the so-called 'multi-sectoral' approach. This has already been demonstrated in the case of health care on Mafia, where a plethora of international aid agencies operates: CARE, UNICEF, DANIDA, WWF, DFID, NORAD, for example. But local NGOs such as Chamama and MICAS are constantly seeking links with and funding from international NGOs as it is very difficult for them to raise funds locally.

Foreign aid agencies and NGOs see themselves as working in partnership with governments and their agencies. Here is an extract from an interview with a UNICEF officer:

UNICEF works alongside NGOs but only at the District level. In Mafia infant feeding activities are being supported by UNICEF through the District Planning Officer, the DED and the DMO.

On Mafia, CARE, whose regional office in Kihaba, is also beginning to work with local NGOs. They have done surveys of all NGOs and checked them out to ensure they are not just 'brief-case', that is, people who are setting up NGOs just to tap money.

Local NGOs are however, a two-edged sword, since they are supposed to be independent of government and may even be critical of it, implicitly or explicitly.

Government policy is also to encourage self-help through cooperative groups (*vikundi*) set up to work on particular projects, particularly income-generation. In Kanga, for example, there were a number of such groups such as women's groups and men's fishing groups.

One group in Kanga was started in 2000 and there are ten members. Here is an extract from my conversation with a group of the members:

Q. Why did you start this group (*kikundi*)?

To improve our lives a bit (*kuendesha maisha kidogo*)

Q. What do you do with the money? Do you have a bank account?

We divide it up – but we do want to open a proper bank account

Q. Would you be able to borrow?

Yes, I think so

Q. How often do you meet?

We planned to meet every month, but it depends...

Q. From whom do you get advice? Do you go to the Village Council or the Mratibu?

No we plan things ourselves.

Q. So what are your needs?

We want a sewing machine and then we could learn to sew and make some money, but we have no capital - we also need money to buy things like pots and khangas from DSM to sell here. We have discussed these things with CARE and sent our request but we haven't had a reply yet.

Q. Do they lend money?

Their main work is around AIDS, but we need a market to sell our mats.

Q. Doesn't belonging to this group) increase your workload?

Yes, it does but we need something.

Q. Are you all related?

No, we are neighbours, we just decided to get together

Q. There didn't used to be such groups, did there?

No, but now life has become harder

Q. In what ways?

Food, clothes, no money!

Another group consisted of a dozen women and had been in existence since my last visit, when they were involved in digging a well in their neighbourhood. I asked the Secretary about their current activities

We mostly do plaiting of raffia – mats (*mikeka*), prayer mats (*misala*) and covers (*mikawa*). We plait together and sew things up together. We divide our money into two – half we keep ourselves, half stays in our bank account and we can draw on it. If someone wants something, they ask the chair and a few members, and if they agreed, they get it.

Q. Where do you sell your products?

Ah, that the problem. We get only T. Sh. 2,000 for each mat here. If we ask someone to sell them for us, he'll want his profit. There is no market here (*soko hakuna*)!

Q. Isn't there any way that you could improve your market?

We were told that we should get together with all the groups in Kanga and Bweni and send a request to the government.

The men's fishing groups were somewhat more successful in obtaining a market for their produce. Here is an extract from an interview with the leader of one such group:

We've been in existence for some years. There are six of us, and some of us are related. We fish with nets from an outrigger canoe. We divide the money from the catch into two: one part is kept in reserve to do repairs, buy nets, rope, etc. and the rest is divided equally. Currently we plan to buy a sail in DSM – that will cost 10,000.

Q. Where do you sell your fish?

A. At the ferry in DSM

11.4. Households, families and kin networks

To what extent do kin relations remain a major area of support for individuals, or has this situation changed over the last few years? There is a certainly a perception that increasing poverty has obliged people to restrict their assistance, especially financial, to close kin only. Even within households, many women find that they have to depend increasingly upon themselves in order to buy clothes, considered to be the responsibility of the husband under Islamic law, because the poverty of many men makes it very difficult for them to support their wives.

I asked a friend in Kanga to give me the costs of his annual budget. He has two wives, and several children and grandchildren live with him. At one time, he would have expected to provide new clothes for each of them at least once, preferably twice a year. This time he didn't even know the price of a dress:

I haven't bought one for ages.

Q. Don't you still have to buy new clothes for everyone each year?

(These days) you might go a whole year and not buy anything.

Most women do not blame men for this situation. As one said: 'Life is hard these days – we have to help each other'. Yet this has also opened up a space for some women to be more empowered. I was struck on this visit by the number of women who were active politically: on the village council and its various committees, involved in women's groups, and taking a leading role as volunteers

at the clinic, as traditional birth attendants, and AIDS educators. Here is one woman who is involved in all of these roles:

As a member of the village council, my work is about planning and attending meetings – we discuss among ourselves, we listen to people. Our current plans are to get the school building finished. There are 5 women and 11 men on the village council.

Q. So do the women get heard?

They listen to us! And we have the right to speak. Previously women did not go to meetings, but now they do.

Q. So do you think women's lives are better today than they used to be?

Yes, they are, because they study and they travel – I myself have been to DSM and Zanzibar.

Q. How do you get trained in the work you do?

We attend seminars twice a year in Kirongwe or Kilindoni

Q. Does your husband agree to this?

(Laughs) Yes, that is progress, things are better.

But in addition to complaints about poverty and lack of ability to give assistance, there were many complaints that people's ideas about sharing and cooperation had also changed.

Interview 1

In the old days people helped each other more. They'd get together in groups of 10-15 – now they want money or they don't help. And these days they don't get on with each other (*hawasikilizani*). And in marriage too – everything is a mess (*mambo yote yamepaparikapaparika*). The times have changed – it is the end of the world. Everything has changed. Only your close family helps you these days.

Interview 2.

Q. What are the differences between today and when you were young?

Everything then was good. There were good relations with the elders, when you cultivated, you got a good harvest, when you fished, you caught something, when you prayed, you received [what you asked for]. The world has changed because people don't respect each other, they are drunkards, adulterers etc. so God has taken his blessing (*baraka*) away from them.

The second informant went on to complain about relations between the generations.

The young people think we know nothing. They call us older people *madinge* (dinghies) – we are just small boats pulled along by big ones!

Another informant criticised the younger generation:

I am worried: the customs of this village will break down (*desturi za mji zitavunjika*). For example, did you see the pictures⁶¹ my son put up on the wall? I don't like them at all, or the kind of videos they show here, or the drinking...

Q. What about the future for your children?

It will be worse - the things they want are not good.

Q. What do you think they want?

⁶¹ They were cut-outs from newspapers and magazines – sports stars, female models, cars.

To go with the times (*mwendo ya kisasa*), that's what they want. They scorn our customs (*desturi*), they might not even greet you respectfully (*kuamkia*)⁶². And if you do want your children to do something, you have to ask them quietly, and if they refuse, it's between them and you [you can't order them about like you used to do].

Part of this gulf between the generations is not only to do with wider social changes, but is also connected to earning capacity. Until a few years ago, men gradually accumulated capital in the form of coconut trees by planting, inheriting and buying. In this way, they were able to earn cash and support their households. Control of cash gave fathers and husbands considerable authority in the household. Today, they can no longer do so while young men can earn from fishing, especially diving for lobsters. But young men do not want to spend their income supporting their natal households – they want consumer goods such as radios, watches and bicycles, they want smart clothes and to spend their evenings watching videos.

Given all of the above, it is perhaps scarcely surprising that when a team of witch-finders⁶³ arrived on Mafia in the summer of 2002, they were welcomed in many villages. In Kanga, at the end of a funeral, a group of men attending put forward a resolution that the village should invite the witch-finders and pay for their services. I discussed this with one village official:

Yes, 80 people said they wanted them. There are witches (*wachawi*⁶⁴) who frighten people and make them ill – we want to stop this.

Q. Have they come before?

No not these people but one called Matoroka came when I was young, a long time ago.

Q. What do they do?

They take out things which make people suffer (*kutesa*). They take out stuff like bottles and charms from houses.

Q. What happens then?

Nothing, we are not like the people in some parts of the mainland where they kill witches. They (witch-finders) just remove things and people go away.

Q. So will everyone agree to their coming?

It looks like it, judging by the meeting yesterday. Some illnesses ... can't be recognised by the hospital but they can play their rattles and find out what the problems are.

Q. Where are they from?

I think they are from the Rufiji. They will have to come via the village office to be given permission. They have been to Jibondo island and other parts of the south, now they are in the north of Mafia.

Q. I have heard many people say that there isn't the same trust as before and that people don't agree between themselves like they did – what do you think?

⁶² Juniors are supposed to greet their elders respectfully by saying *Shikamoo* (lit. 'I hold your feet'). I noticed on many occasions that they no longer did so, especially the boys. Once my research assistant told me how shocked he was that one of my nephews had failed to greet me properly.

⁶³ Historically, witch-finding movements have arisen regularly in East Africa in the 20th century, usually during times of rapid change. See Richards 1935, Schoenman 1975.

⁶⁴ In this conversation, the term *mchawi* (usually translated as 'witch') was used, but others, as is seen below, used the term *mwanga*, which is often translated as 'sorcerer'. In the conversations around the topic of the witch-finders, people used either term.

It's not about administration (*utawala*), its about people persecuting each other (kutesana), things have really got worse in terms of witchcraft and people's wickedness (*mambo yamezidi, uchawi, ubaya wa watu*).

A woman friend in the village explained further:

After the funeral today, there was a meeting to discuss whether to call the witch-finders who are now in Bweni. It was agreed to. There haven't been any such since I was pregnant with my youngest son (now an adult)– those who came then were called Watoroko. I hear that each household pays T. Sh. 1,200 to have them go into their house and take out any witchcraft objects.

Q. Why are they needed?

There are too many witches (*wanga*) – people don't sleep at night. And in Bweni the witches buried two goats alive (*na roho zao*) and they stayed alive.

Q. So will they come here?

I don't have the money to bring them here but my son might pay. They take all sorts of things out of your body – charms (*hirizi*), bottles (*chupa*). There are about 30 of them divided into groups going to different villages on Mafia. Kanga wants the ones in Banja to come to them. Almost everyone in Kang agreed to this. They will put medicine (*dawa*) in the wells so that when those who refused treatment go to get water ...[it will be revealed if they are witches].

Q. (to son who has just arrived) Will you pay the money to the witch-finders?

Yes, if I can get it! They come and look at your house.

Unfortunately, I had to leave the village before the arrival of the witch-finders.

The literature on witch-finding suggests that such movements tend to arise at times of acute social upheaval and change. Some of the people with whom I discussed the current lack of trust between kin and neighbours recognised that it had arisen from material factors, as the following informant stated:

Q. What are the main differences between your childhood and now?

There are many. [In those days] The elders were there and would help you with your troubles. But now they aren't there for us. So if you have a problem you have to deal with it yourself. In those days lots of things were free, there were things available, and there was faith (*imani*). Now there are no people [to help you], there is no trust, and there are no things [available].

Q. So where does all this come from?

Human beings

Q. Why do you think there is a lack of trust?

It comes from problems and lack of basic needs (*shida na dhiki*). People can't support themselves, let alone others.

Q. Do you think poverty has increased since then?

Yes, definitely. We can't depend on anything now.

Q. So you can't depend on coconuts any more?

No, that's when trust disappeared.

11.5. Blaming Swahili culture

Sometimes in the course of a discussion about why things were not going well, people would attribute blame to Swahili culture. 'You know what we Swahili are like' is a self-deprecating phrase I have heard many times over the years. What did people mean by this? That people would seek to take advantage of a situation, put their own interests first. As one man put it: 'Here there's a lot of back-biting (*fitina*),

that's our character, we Swahili people'. That they would suffer from jealousy (*wivu*) if someone did better than they did. For this reason, secrecy is highly cultivated – gifts are given in private, with promises of not telling anyone, lest they too come and demand.

Yet such negative views of Swahili values are outweighed by ideals⁶⁵ which state that people should help each other, respect each other, speak the truth, as indeed many do.

There was also a recognition on the part of some that coastal people had been historically disadvantaged because of the refusal of many of them to send their children to school during the colonial period. This was a point made during a conversation with two young men who had studied at secondary school:

Q. What do you think are the main problems here on Mafia?

Poverty and lack of education. Education is backward, the primary schools are poor, levels of English are poor, you have to compete with kids from Kilimanjaro.

Q. Why is it better there than here?

Because of its history – the colonialists brought education there, but the coastal people were not keen on education – they were afraid that their children would change religion. So it's really made us backward.

11.6. Depending on oneself

Responsibility was not infrequently attributed to the individual, especially in terms of work and self-control. A number of men, in particular, criticised others for not working hard enough. While conceding that times were hard, they argued that those who cultivated as much land as possible or engaged in fishing could make a living, albeit with difficulty.

Q. Why do you think people keep saying that life is hard?

Because they don't work hard enough. Once you've reached a certain age, you rest on the verandah.

Q. But surely that's only for men, not women?

That's true.

The second area in which the individual carried responsibility was in terms of sexual mores. Many people who were asked about HIV/AIDS said that the only solution was the control of sexual urges and restricting relations to a single partner. Here is part of a conversation with a young woman:

Q. Do you think life will be harder or easier in future?

Harder because of AIDS. People may die before their children are grown

Q. What can you do to stop this?

You have to depend on yourself, control yourself.

11.7. Depending on God

It was not uncommon to hear, when someone died, that the death was '*kazi ya Mungu*'. Similarly, people might attribute the 'state of the times' (*wakati*) or the

⁶⁵ For a discussion of Swahili ideals and their break-down, see Saleh 2003

weather to God's will: 'the times have changed – it's God's work only' as one man said. Some saw AIDS as a punishment or test from God. Such attitudes are often thought by outsiders to be examples of fatalism, they deny agency to human beings. Yet people do recognise other forms of agency, even as they attribute power to God. This gives them the right to complain about those whom they consider have let them down. But it also means they have the responsibility to take action themselves.

11.8 Summary and Discussion

In all of the areas mentioned above, people bemoaned what they saw as a diminution in trust. They felt that people they could previously have counted on – kin, neighbours, fellow villagers – no longer gave support or showed sympathy for troubles. Many thought that the Village Government, even the District Government, were ineffectual, since decisions were made at the top, in spite of the rhetoric which said otherwise.

So whom do they blame for their current state of increasing poverty, for the *maisha magumu* that most of them have to put up with?

In most societies at most times, there is a harking back to a past 'golden age' when people's lives were better. This is as true on Mafia as elsewhere, and much of the discourse I have discussed in this section I have heard on previous visits. On this occasion, however, there was a difference. One was in the prevailing view of government and politicians as corrupt, the other was in the levels of pessimism people expressed.

The discourse of corruption is all-pervasive, and colours all dealings between village people and officialdom. Some of the many stories are probably true, but the point is that people believe all of them to be true, they hear everything said by officials in this light: 'we are being consumed' (*tunaliwa*) was a frequent phrase. As a result, it is very difficult to motivate people because the premise on which they operate is that officials are acting in their own interests, and that they, the small people, cannot get anything they want unless they can pay bribes. Here is a sample of statements from villagers:

Our leaders are all strangers here. They haven't come to raise the place up, but to get their own profit... They treat the place like a field – they harvest and leave... They get their millions, we get ripped off. We weep, we can't do anything, while they get their income

A. There is a *major* problem here – all the big people are outsiders and they 'eat'. Occasionally they have local friends who benefit (*wanarambaramba*). The people here [on Mafia] are not educated, they are backward, so the others do as they like.

Q. What about the District Council?

A. They try, but they are not educated, so they are not equal, the educated and the uneducated (*hawalingana*)... Most of the money for the road was 'eaten' – you see its state now. Similarly with the airport. The big and the little people conspire to defraud.

They use our money as they like, they build their big houses

Secondly, most people look to the future with fear. 'We will eat grass' is how one man (actually a civil servant) put it, after lamenting the sale of national assets to foreigners. I asked many people what they thought the lives of their grandchildren would be like: 'Perhaps good, but more likely harder. They will have to scabble for a living' was a typical reply.

12.0. Dissemination, follow-up and reciprocity

a) Dissemination of findings

- Short reports have already been sent to the Nuffield and Leverhulme Foundations and the Research Committee of Goldsmiths College.
- The current Report to COSTECH will be copied to colleagues in the University of DSM, officials on Mafia, and Ministries and NGOs where I conducted interviews
- A video film in Swahili will be sent back to the island, and another version with an English commentary will be used for educational purposes in the UK.
- It is proposed to deliver conference papers (some of this material has already been delivered at an international conference on risk in Tokyo in March 2003, and more will be given at a keynote lecture in Cape Town in August of this year), and write articles in academic journals, including some published in Tanzania.

b) I have been asked to do the following in order to assist people on Mafia:

- Investigate some kind of fair trade market (e.g. with Oxfam) for the sale of the raffia mats woven by women which are the main source of their cash income. Increasing women's income would be an important way of decreasing household poverty.
- Try to set up a twinning arrangement between the secondary school on Mafia and a secondary school in Britain. This would not only enrich the educational experience of the British students, but also enable fund-raising for e.g. books and equipment for the latter, and the possibility of reciprocal visits.
- Write a short book about Mafia in Kiswahili.
- Produce a pictorial record of Kanga village, using the still photographs which I have taken over the years. Rather than doing this as an album, my plan is to put this material onto a video which can be viewed by a large number of people.
- Provide information and contacts about HIV/AIDS for MICAS and the District Hospital and a textbook on gynaecology for one of the doctors (done).
- Provide information about courses in the UK to a variety of government officials (done)

- I have also provided human and veterinary medicines not easily available in Tanzania to a number of villagers, am supporting two Mafia children through secondary school, and assisting another youth through higher studies in the UK.

13. 00. Policy implications and recommendations

In this section I put forward some suggestions for steps which could be considered to improve the current problems for people living on Mafia.

There are a number of major issues around the future development of Mafia:

1. Should Mafia seek development through large-scale developments, such as commercial fishing and tourism, or through small-scale projects, or a mixture of the two? If it is to be the first of these, how much will local people benefit?
2. Will development be entirely imposed and top-down, or can a form of truly participatory development be evolved? This involves tackling the issue of the different interests at stake in these issues and finding mechanisms for resolving, or at least, mitigating conflicts of interest.
3. What is to be the relationship between the half of Mafia within the Marine Park, and the remainder which is outside its boundaries? Is the former to receive most of the development benefits and the latter much less? Or is the latter area to be developed with much less attention to sustainability?

In what follows, I do not presume to answer the above questions, but to make a number of suggestions which might be considered at national and district level.

13.1. Making use of existing information

Copies of all research carried out on Mafia should be made available at a central location in the district capital, and anyone should be able to view this material. It should also be a condition of the granting of a research visa to a foreign national that

- a) they write a comprehensive Report to Costech,
- b) copies of this report are made available locally
- c) there should be at least a summary of the findings in Kiswahili made available
- d) copies of all such material should also be deposited in the Library of the University of Dar es Salaam.

13.2. Improvement of infrastructure

a) Transport

Transport on the island and to and from the mainland still needs to be improved - better roads, an improved runway at the airport, maintenance of the ferry service to Dar es Salaam, construction of a jetty at Kilindoni harbour. In addition, there should be regular and affordable vehicle services to and from the District Capital to all parts of the island and from Kilindoni to the District Hospital.

b) Power

Electricity generation needs improvement and a wider area of the island should be connected. Thought should be given to the development of small-scale power units, utilising solar or wind energy, in the villages, especially for the pumping of water and the provision of small mills to alleviate women's workload in pounding rice.

c) Telecommunications

There should be the establishment of a cell phone facility to enable better communication with the rest of Tanzania.

The radiophones installed in a number of villages by the Marine Park should be better maintained (the one in Bweni did not work the whole time I was on the island last summer), and more villages need such facilities (Kanga for example does not have one).

13.3. Alleviation of poverty

People need both relief from existing expenses, where possible, and the generation of additional income:

a) Removal of dues

These are payable when coconuts are transported to the mainland, thereby decreasing still further the prospect of any profit from their sale. Such dues should either be reduced or removed.

b) More income-generating projects, especially for women.

In my previous report (Caplan 1995), I suggested that more assistance be given to the making and marketing of raffia mats for which Mafia has long been famous. Little appears to have been done about this.

c) Assistance with cultivation of cashewnuts

Prices for this crop are currently higher than they have been, but sulphur dusting is needed to ensure viability.

13.4. Improvement of education*a) Improvement of schools*

Many primary schools lack sufficient classrooms, desks, and other equipment. They also lack sufficient teachers. This situation needs remedying urgently if Mafia is to develop.

At the secondary level, what is needed is

- more teachers, and particularly more local teachers
- scholarships for children to defray costs of tuition and living expenses
- better facilities in the school in terms of books and equipment
- the rapid completion of the second secondary school in Kirongwe to serve the northern villages

b) Better facilities for teachers, more local teachers

Facilities for teachers coming from outside should be improved, including the provision of housing and payment of travel costs by ferry for regular home leave. It is also suggested that the District seek to encourage a number of young people to train as teachers, perhaps by the provision of scholarships.

13.5. Improvement of health, including AIDS prevention

a) Village clinics

While treatment at the village level has undoubtedly improved, facilities and equipment at clinics still need to be improved.

b) District Hospital

The payment of fees at the District Hospital is a big disincentive for villagers. Fees for treatment at hospital should be removed if possible for all, If this cannot be done universally, then it should be carried out on a means-tested basis, and in all cases for the elderly and for children.

The District hospital needs a fuller complement of staff, especially in essential areas, and staff need improved working conditions as above.

c) Conditions for health workers

Medical staff posted from outside often lack housing and find it difficult to visit their home areas. They too need housing, and assistance with travel to home

d) Liaison between medical and health workers

There are a number of local and outside bodies carrying out important work in the medical field: however, it is not clear to what extent there is liaison between them, or whether they are aware of work being done by other bodies. A holistic approach needs to be adopted. It is imperative that copies of all reports and publications arising from work carried out on Mafia should be placed in a central location in the District Capital, preferably with at least a summary in Swahili, so that they can be consulted by others

e) HIV/AIDS

Much more needs to be done locally in the way of AIDS education awareness campaigns at all levels, including primary and secondary schools. To this end, more volunteers and local leaders should be trained in skills required.

13.6. Relations between government officials and Mafians

a) Recruitment of local people for government service

If the educational levels on Mafia could be raised, more local people could enter government service (Boma departments, health, education)

b) Working conditions for government servants

Most government servants are badly underpaid, a situation which lends itself to corrupt practices.

The current transfer system should either be dropped, or should be organised in such a way that government servants can spend sufficient time in an area to become familiar with its requirements

Where possible civil servants should work in their home areas. where they are familiar with the local conditions and culture.

There should be better facilities such as housing and travel allowances for civil servants posted to Mafia

More in-service training courses should be made available to government servants so that they can keep up to date with developments, improve their skills and develop their careers.

c) Communication between government servants and with local people

There needs to be more consultation between government servants and local people, with the latter receiving more explanations of policies, and the former being more willing to listen to local views.

To this end, documentation in Swahili should always be made available to local people when projects which impinge upon them are contemplated.

13.7. Policy towards inward investment and large-scale development projects

a) Focus on eco-tourism

The government has stated that it is the policy to develop eco-tourism in the south of the country, including Mafia. The term needs clearer definition, and implementation in terms of local contexts. Permission for any development should not be given unless there has been a proper Environmental Impact Assessment, which gives due weight to social and cultural, as well as environmental factors.

b) Permission for development conditional on assistance to community

There should be conditions attached to all large-scale development (hotels, prawn farms, plantations etc) in terms of clearly specified material assistance to the local community, and an undertaking to employ and train local people. Such conditions should be regularly monitored and enforced.

c) Maintenance of existing rights

No development should be contemplated which takes away people's existing rights. The rights of local people to pathways, beaches etc. should be spelled out to potential developers.

d) Monitoring and liaison

A monitoring committee, comprising district officials, local people, and representatives of the management of the project should be set up. This should meet on a regular basis several times a year to discuss issues of concern. Annual reports should be forwarded to relevant authorities at the District and National levels.

13.0. Mapendekezo na Uchangiaji wa Sera

Katika sehemu hii napendelea kutoa mapendekezo na hatua zinazostahiki kuchukuliwa ili kuboresha na kutatua matatizo yanayowakabili wanavijiji waishio Mafia.

13.1 Kuhusu tafiti na habari za Mafia

Nakala za kila utafiti wa Kisiwa cha Mafia zipatikane katika sehemu moja katika makao ya Wilaya ili iwe rahisikwa kila mwenye kutaka habari zake kuzipata kwa urahisi. Hii iwe ni miongoni mwa sharti kwa kila mgeni mtafiti kuweza kupewa ruhusa ya kutafiti na kisha:

- a) kuandika muhtasari wa utafiti kwa Costech.
- b) nakala za ripoti hiyo ziweze kupatikana kwa urahisi hapa nchini
- c) na kuwepo kwa muhtasari wa matokeo ya utafiti kwa Kiswahili
- d) nakala za kila kazi ziwekwe katika maktaba ya chuo kikuu cha Dar es Salaam.

13.2. Kuboresha kwa miundo-mbinu

a) Usafiri

Usafiri wa kwenda na kutoka kisiwani hadi bara unahitajika uimarishwe- ubora wa barabara, njia ya kutua/kurukia ndege, ukarabati wa huduma ya meli kwenda Dare es Salaam, ujenzi wa gati katika bandari ya Kilindoni. Vilevile kuwepo kwa usafiri wa magari wa kuaminika, wenye nafuu, kati ya Kilindoni hadi sehemu mbalimbali za kisiwa cha Mafia na pia kati Kilindoni na Hospitali ya Wilaya.

b) Nishati

Ipo haja ya kuhakikisha kuwa generata ya umeme inakarabatiwa na inatanua mtandao wake katika eneo kubwa zaidi. Ipo haja pia ya kutilia maanani miradi midogo ya kutoa umeme, matumizi ya nishati ya jua na upepo huko vijijini ili kusaidia kusukuma maji na kusindika nafaka ili kuwapunguzia wakina mama mzigo wa kutwanga kwa vinu.

c) Mawasiliano

Ipo haja ya kuwepo kwa mtandao wa simu za mikononi ili kuiunganisha Mafia na sehemu nyenginezo nchini.

13.3. Kupiga vita umaskini

Ipo haja ya kuwapunguzia watu unafuu wa matumizi pale inapobidi na kuhakikisha kuongezwa kwa kipato cha ziada.

a) Ushuru

Kodi hizi zinalipwa wakati wa usafirishaji wa nazi kwenda bara, hivyo kuwapunguzia tija katika mauzo yao. Kodi hizo hazina budi kupunguzwa au kuondolewa kabisa.

b) Uongezaji wa miradi ya kuboresha vipato haswa ya kinamama

Katika ripoti yangu (Caplan 1995), nimependekeza kwamba hakuna budi msaada utolewe katika utengenezaji na mauzo ya mikeka ambayo ni maarufu kutokea

Mafia. Inaelekea hakuna lililofanyika hadi sasa.

c) Msaada kwa kilimo cha korosho

Bei ya zao hili ni kubwa kuliko ilivyokuwa hapo karibuni, lakini upatikanaje wa pembejeo kama vile 'sulphur' ni wa shida.

13.4. Elimu

a) Uboreshaji wa mashule

Shule nyingi za msingi hazina madarasa ya kutosha, madawati, na vifaa vya kiada. Kuna upungufu wa waalimu wa kutosha. Hali hii ni lazima ibadilike haraka iwapo tunahitaji kupata maendeleo ya haraka kisiwani Mafia.

Kwa upande wa sekondari tunahitaji

- waalimu zaidi na haswa waalimu wazawa wa Mafia.
- kuna haja watoto kupewa ufadhili wa fedha ili kuwapunguzia mzigo wa gharama za masomo na maisha.
- kuna haja ya kuboresha vitabu na vifaa vya shule
- kuna haja ya kumalizika kwa ujenzi wa sekondari Kirongwe ili kuhudumia vijiji vya kaskazini.

b) Huduma bora kwa waalimu na waalimu wazawa.

Huduma kwa waalimu wageni kutoka nje ya Mafia hazina budi kuimarishwa, wapewe nyumba na malipo ya usafiri wa meli wanapopata likizo. Vilevile inashauriwa kwamba Wilaya haina budi kuwamotisha vijana kuchukua mafunzo ya ualimu, kwa njia ya ufadhili wa mikopo ya masomo.

13. 5. Masuala ya Afya na UKIMWI

a) Zahanati za vijijini

Wakati huduma za matibabu katika ngazi ya vijiji zimeboreka kiasi, ipo haja ya kuimarisha vifaa na huduma za zahanati.

b) Hospitali ya Wilaya

Ulipiaji huduma za matibabu katika hospitali ya wilaya ni kipingamizi kikubwa cha wanavijiji walio wengi. Malipo hayo hayana budi kufutwa kabisa inapobidi. Iwapo haiwezekani kufutwa kwa ujumla basi iangaliwe utaratibu wa kuwafutia wazee na watoto.

Hospitali ya wilaya inahitaji kukamilishwa kwa wahudumu, haswa katika maeneo nyeti, na kuboreshwa kwa mazingira ya utendeji kazi.

c) Huduma za wafanyakazi wa afya.

Wauguzi wanaotokea nje ya Mafia hawana huduma za nyumba na hupata tabu wanataka kwenda makwao wakati wa likizo. Wao pia wanahitaji huduma za nyumba na msaada wa usafiri kwenda makwao.

d) Mahusiano baina ya wauguzi na wahudumu wa afya.

Kuna vyombo mbalimbali vya nje na ndani vinavyojishughulisha na utoaji huduma za afya. Hakuna uhakika ni kwa kiasi gani vyombo hivyo vinashirikiana baina yao au kama wanafahamu kazi zinazofanywa na vyombo vyengine kama hivyo. Hakuna budi kuwepo kwa mfumo utakaoanisha vyombo hivyo. Ni vyema nakala za kazi

zote ziwekwe katika makao makuu ya wilaya ikiwezekana pamoja na nakala ya muhtasari wake kwa Kiswahili ili ziweze kusomwa na wengine.

e) Ukimwi

Kampeni za kuelimisha watu juu ya ugonjwa wa UKIMWI hazina budi kuimarishwa katika ngazi zote, ikiwemo shule za msingi na sekondari. Hivyo hakuna budi watu wa kujitolea na viongozi wafundishwe mbinu zinazostahiki.

13. 6. Uhusiano kati ya viongozi wa serikali na wananchi wa Mafia.

a) Uajiri wa wenyeji katika kazi za serikali.

Kama viwango vya elimu vitaongezwa kwa wenyeji wa Mafia, wazawa wengi wataongezeka katika sekta mbalimbali za utumishi serikalini. (Idara ya Boma, afya, elimu).

b) Mazingira ya utendaji kazi ya watumishi wa serikali

Wengi wa watumishi wa serikali wanalipwa mishahara duni, hali inayopelekea kuongezeka kwa vitendo ya rushwa.

Mtindo wa kuhamisha watumishi wa serikali mara kwa mara hauna budi uachwe au kuruhusu watumishi wakae kwa muda mrefu ili wazoe mazingira wanayopangiwa. Kama upo uwezekano watumishi wapangiwe sehemu wanakotokea ambako wamezoea mazingira na desturi zake.

Pawepo na huduma za nyumba na posho za usafiri kwa watumishi wanaokwenda kufanya kazi Mafia.

Watumishi wapewe mafunzo kazini ili wapate kujielimisha na kuboresha ujuzi wao wa utendaji wa kazi.

c) Mawasiliano kati ya watumishi wa serikali na wananchi

Ipo haja kuwepo masikilizano baina ya viongozi wa serikali na wananchi wanaowaongoza. Viongozi wa serikali hawanabudi kuwaelewesha wananchi sera mbalimbali na wao pia kujifunza na kusikiliza maoni ya wananchi wanaowaongoza.

13. 7. Miradi mikubwa ya kimaendeleo

a) Mtazamo wa utalii-mazingira

Serikali imeweka msimamo wa kuendeleza utalii-mazingira katika sehemu za kusini mwa Tanzania ikiwemo Mafia. Dhana hii inahitajika kufafanuliwa na kutekelezeka katika muktadha wa sehemu za wenyeji. Ruhusa isitolewe hadi pamefanyika tathmini ya kwa kiasi gani vipengele vya jamii, utamaduni na mazingira vimehusishwa.

b) Sharti la kusaidia maendeleo ya jamii na jumuiya husika

Hakuna budi utoaji wa vibali vya kuendesha miradi mikubwa (hoteli, ufugaji wa kamba, mashamba makubwa) viambatane na kuwekwa kwa masharti ya kusaidia maendeleo ya jamii husika kwa kutoa ajira kwawenyeji na kuwafunza wenyeji kuendesha miradi hiyo. Lazima pawepo na ukaguzi wa mara kwa mara wa utekelezaji wa sharti hilo.

c) Kuthamini uhuru na haki zilizopo

Pasiwepo na uamuzi wa kuathiri haki za wananchi kama vile kufungwa njia au

pwani. Wawekezaji hawana budi kuelezwa bayana juu ya kutozuiwa wananchi kuwa huru katika maeneo yanayotarajiwa kumilikiwa na wawekezaji hao.

d) Usimamizi/ ufuatiliaji na ushirikiano

Kamati ya usimamizi yenye kuhusisha viongozi wa wilaya, wenyeji, na wawakilishi wa wakuu wa miradi haina budi kuundwa. Kamati hii inawajibika kukutana mara kwa mara kujadili masuala mbalimbali yanayojitokeza.

Bibliography

a) Publications on Mafia Island

Albonico, M. M. Ramsan, V. Wright, K. Jape, H.J. Haji, M., Taylor, L. Savioli, and Q. Bickle. 2002. 'Soil-transmitted nematode infections and mebendazole treatment in Mafia Island school children.' *Annals of Tropical Medicine and Parasitology* 96, 7: 717-25.

Andrews, G, 1998. 'Mafia Island Marine Park, Tanzania: implications of applying a marine park paradigm in a developing country' unpub. conf. paper. ITMEMS 1998 Proceedings. Available on the following web site:
www.reefbase.org/pdf/itmems98/itmems_267-279_s07_2.pdf

Baumann, Oskar, 1896. *Die Insel Mafia* Leipzig (see also Freeman-Grenville)

Caplan, P. 1975 *Choice and Constraint in a Swahili Community: Property, Hierarchy and Cognatic Descent on the East African Coast* Oxford University Press/International African Institute (162 pp.)

1976: "Boys' circumcision and girls' puberty rites among the Swahili of Mafia Island Tanzania" *Africa* 46, 1: 21-33

1978 "The Swahili of Chole Island, Tanzania" in A. Sutherland (ed.) *Face Values* BBC/RAI: 140-75

1981: "Development Policies in Tanzania: Some Implications for Women" in *The Journal of Development Studies* 17, 3: 98-108 (also published in N. Nelson (ed.) *African Women in the Development Process* Frank Cass, 1981)

1982 "Gender, Ideology and Modes of Production on the East African coast" in J. de Vere Allen (ed.) *From Zinj to Zanzibar: History, Trade and Society on the Coast of East Africa* Franz Steiner Verlag: 29-43

1983 "Women's Property, Islamic Law and Cognatic Descent" in R. Hirschon (ed.) *Women and Property, Women as Property* Croom Helm: 23-43

1989: "Perceptions of gender stratification" *Africa* September: 196-208

1992a Editor (with F. le Guennec-Coppens) *Les Swahili entre Afrique et Arabie* Paris: Karthala (216pp.)

1992b "Socialism from above; the view from below" in Peter Forster (ed.) *Tanzanian Peasantry: Economy in Crisis* Gower Press 1992: 103-23 (also as "Socialism from above in Tanzania: the view from below" in ASA volume *Socialism in Anthropological Theory and Local Practice* ed. Chris Hann. Routledge, 1993: 77-91)

1993b "Learning Gender: field-work in a Tanzanian coastal village, 1965-85" in *Gendered Fields* ed. D. Bell, P. Caplan and W. Karim. Routledge: 168-81.

1995a. *Food, Health and Fertility Further Investigated with Particular Reference to Gender: a Report on Fieldwork on Mafia Island, Tanzania, June-August 1994*. Report present to the Tanzania National Scientific Research Council, July 1995 (38pp.)

1995b "Law and custom: marital disputes on Mafia Island, Tanzania" in P. Caplan (ed.) *Understanding Disputes: the Politics of Law*. Berg Press. pp. 203-22.

1995c "'Children are our wealth and we want them": a difficult pregnancy on Mafia Island, Tanzania' in D. Bryceson (ed.) *Women Wielding the Hoe: Lessons from Rural Africa for Feminist Theory and Development Practice* Berg Press, 1995.

1995d "'In my office we don't have closing hours: Gendered household relations in a Swahili village in northern Mafia Island" in Colin Creighton and Cuthbert Omari (eds.) *Gender, Family, and Household in Tanzania* Avebury, 1995, pp. 118-38.

1995e 'Monogamy, polygyny or the single state? Changes in marriage in a Tanzanian coastal village, 1965-94.' in C. Creighton ed. *Gender, Family and Household in Tanzania* vol. II Avebury Press.

1997 *African Voices, African Lives: Personal Narratives from a Swahili Village* London and New York: Routledge (266 pp.)

1998 'Experiencing old age on Mafia Island, Tanzania' in M. Aguilar (ed.) *Social Models of Gerontocracy in Africa* Lawrenceville, N.J.: African World Press.

1998 'La vie politique en mutation d'un village cotier de la Tanzanie' in F. le Guennec-Coppens and David Parkin *Autorite et Pouvoir chez les Swahili*. Paris: Karthala, IPRA, Nairobi. pp. 77-97.

1999 'Where have all the young girls gone? Gender and sex ratios on Mafia Island, Tanzania' in *Agrarian Economy, State and Society in Contemporary Tanzania* ed. P. Forster and S. Maghimbi. Avebury Press.

2000. 'Monogamy, Polygyny or the single state? Changes in marriage patterns in a Tanzanian coastal village, 1965-94.' in C. Creighton and C.K. Omari *Gender, Family and Work in Tanzania* Ashgate, Aldershot, Burlington USA, Singapore, Sydney

2003. 'Struggling to be modern: recent letters from Mafia Island'. In P. Caplan and F. Topan (eds.) *Swahili Modernities*. Lawrenceville, NJ.: Africa World Press.

Chittick, N. 1961. *Kisiman Mafia: Exclavations as an Islamic settlement on the East African Coast* Occasional paper no. 12. Ministry of Education, Antiquities Division.

Clark, K.M. 1994. *People and Bats: Conservation of the Comoros Lesser Fruit Bat on Mafia Island, Tanzania*. Dissertation for the M.Phil. in Geography, University of Cambridge.

Eide, R. 2000. *Kvinner I Tiden: Om sosial konstruksjon av tid pa Mafia, Tanzania*. Thesis presented to the Institute of Social Anthropology, University of Oslo.

Environmental Association of Tanzania (ENATA) 'Environmental impact assessment for the proposed shrimp farming project in Mafia Island' submitted to the National Environment Management Council on behalf of Alphakrust Ltd. May 2003.

Freeman-Grenville, G.S.P. 1957. 'Prefatory note to Bauman's Mafia Island'. *Tanganyika Notes and Records*, 46, 1-24.

J.C. Horrill and MAK Ngoile, 1992. Mafia Island Project Report number 2 (vol. 1 text, vol. 2 appendices) The Society for Environmental Exploration and the University of Dar es Salaam.

Japhnet-Mulyila, Esther, 2001. *Socio-economic impacts of marine protected areas: the case of Mafia Island Marine Park in Tanzania*. Thesis presented for the M.Sc. in International Fisheries Management, University of Tromsø.

King, N. 1917. 'Mafia' *Geographical Journal*. 117-25.

Mayers, C.J., MAK Ngoile, J.C. Horrill, P. Nnyiti, C.K. Runisha, T.R. Young, 1992. *The Proposed Mafia Island Marine Park: Discussion Paper*, Tanzania Ministry of Tourism, Natural Resources and Environment

Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism, Board of Trustees, Marine Park and Reserves, Tanzania, 2000. *Mafia Island Marine Park: General Management Plan*. Dar es Salaam.

Palazzo, Katia, 1999. *Social Change e Sviluppo Turistico nel Parco Marina di Mafia (Tanzania) (Social Change and Tourist Development in the Mafia Island Marine Park)*. Thesis presented to the Università degli Studi di Roma "La Sapienza", for the Corso di Laurea in Lettere.

Piggott, D.W.I, 1941. 'History of Mafia' *Tanganyika Notes and Records* no. 11. (this originally appeared in the *Mafia District Book*)

Revington, T.M. 1936. 'Some notes on the Mafia Island Group' *Tanganyika Notes and Records* no. 1. 33-7. (this originally appeared in the *Mafia District Book*).

Walley, Christine J. 1999. *Making Waves: struggles over the environment, development and participation in the Mafia Island Marine Park, Tanzania*. Unpublished Ph.D. thesis, New York University

Walley, 2003. 'Our Ancestors Used to Bury their "Development" in the Ground:' Modernity and the Meaning of Development within the Mafia Island Marine Park, Tanzania in P. Caplan and F. Topan (eds.) *Swahili Modernities* Africa World Press

b) Other Publications and References

Beckerleg, S. 2003. 'Modernity has been Swahili-ised: The case of Malindi' in P. Caplan and F. Topan (eds.) *Swahili Modernities*. Lawrenceville, NJ.: Africa World Press.

De Villiers, J. nd. 'Projects on Chole Island' Chole Mjini Conservation and Development Company Ltd. Available on www.africatourismresource.com/africa/E/tanzania/accommodation/s/TO2-mafia/03/TCHO/TCHOS.doc

Environmental Justice Foundation, 2003. 'Smash and grab: conflict, occruption and human rights abuses in the shrimp farming industry' A report by the Environmental Justice Foundation, London (also available on several websites, including www.ejf.org)

Government of Tanzania, 1996 *The Report of the Presidential Inquiry against Corruption*, (the Warioba Commission). EDI/WB

Heilman, B, K. Ngh'wanza and L. Ndumbara, nd. 'Is kapa's honeymoon over? Corruption, politics and societal values in Tanzania' fdraft conference paper available on <http://www.aos.co.zw/Publications/AIJP/Heilman.html>

Hoseah, E.G. 2001. 'Measure fo combat corruption at the local national and international level' paper presented at the 15th International Conference on politics, crime and Criminal Justice, organized y the International Society for the Reform of Criminal Law, Canberra 26th-30th August.

Lissu, T.A. 1999 'Environmental Impact Assessment of foreign investment projects: a study in the law, policy and governmental decision-making in Tazania' available on LEAT website www.lead.or.tz

LEAT 2000 'The Rufiji Delt Prawn Farming Project'
(www.lead.or.tz/publications/foreigninvestment/2.rufiji.delt.project.php)

Martinez-Alier, J. 2001. Ecological conflicts and valuation – mangroves vs. shrimps in the late 1990s' (www.h-economica.uab.es/unitat/papers/4-2001)

Maghji, Z. nd. 'Statement on eco-tourism' in *Swahili Coast* magazine
(<http://www.swahilicoast.com/eco.htm>)

Mkapa, B. 1996. 'Opening Address by the President of the United Republic of Tanzania, at the Judges and Magistrates Seminar, Karimjee Hall, Dar es Salaam. Available on African Presidential Archives and Research Center at Boston University
(<http://www.bu.edu/resources/tanzania%speeches%201996/mkapa%20j>)

Preston, P. 1999. 'Not worth a shrug: If you think corruption is a victimless crime, just try daily life in Tanzania' *Guardian* (UK newspaper) March 15th 1999.

Primavera, J. Honculada, 1998. 'Tropical Shrimp Farming and its sustainability' in S. de Silva (ed.) *Tropical Mariculture*. San Diego, London: Academic Press.

Quarto, Alfredo, n.d., 'The rise and fall of the blue revolution' Mangrove Action Project
www.earthisland.org/map/blrvl.htm (originally published in *SWARA*, the East Africa Wildlife Society's magazine)

Richards, A. 1935 'A modern movement of witch-finders' *Africa* 8:448-461.

Ringia, D.W. and S.J. Porter, 1999 'Access to environmental information in Tanzania'
(www.lead.or.tz/publications/access.to.information)

Saleh, M, 2003. 'Going with the times' in P. Caplan and F. Topan (eds.) *Swahili Modernities*. Africa World Press.

Schoenman, T.J. 1975 'The witch hunt as a culture change phenomenon' *Ethnos* 1973, 3, 529-554 (also available on www.lclark.edu/~schoen/culturetext.html)

Stedman-Edwards, nd. 'Tanzania: Rufiji, Ruvu and Wami'
(www.panda.org/resources/programmes/mpo/library/download/rctanzania)

World Rainforest Movement Bulletin www.wrm.org.uy/countries/Africa/

Appendix 1. Research Proposal: (abbreviated version)

Local Understandings of Modernity: Food and Food Security on Mafia Island, Tanzania

Application Presented to the Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology (COSTECH)
August 2001 For Fieldwork June-August 2002

1. Background

I am an academic anthropologist who has taught for 25 years at Goldsmiths College, University of London. My theoretical interests include development, gender relations, food, health and risk. My area specialisms lie in East Africa and South Asia. I have worked on Mafia Island, off the southern coast of Tanzania, since 1965, have published 2 monographs and numerous chapters and articles, made a TV film, and researched a wide variety of topics (gender, food, health, fertility, local/state politics, personal narratives). I have returned to this field site on average once every decade since the 1960s and would like to do so again in 2002.

2. Summary of Research Proposal (including rationale, theoretical and conceptual background)

In Tanzania, as elsewhere, people are confronted with changes which are having profound repercussions on their lives: many feel themselves to be living in a 'runaway' world (Giddens 1999, Leach 1968). Yet in order to act in this world, they have to try to make sense of it and to find explanations for what is happening. Whereas the anthropological study of 'local' or 'indigenous' knowledge has recently burgeoned, and indeed has attracted the attention of many outside of the discipline, this current programme will consider local understandings of global processes and what is sometimes glossed as 'modernity', a shorthand for an enormous range of issues from the spread of global capitalism to technological change.

In order to find a way through this complexity, I propose to use food as the major, although not the sole, vehicle for seeking local understandings of such issues since it carries a rich symbolic load and is also an important means of expressing social relations. In the context of modernity, the study of food also involves consideration of risk, trust, and doubt; of morality and entitlements; views of progress and the future as well as memory, nostalgia and the past; and the perceived dichotomy between lay and expert systems of knowledge.

3. Research programme: detailed exposition

Local knowledge of global processes: food and food security – a case study from Tanzania

a) theoretical background

Industrialisation, capitalism, compression of time and space, science and new bio-technologies, the advance in communication technologies, intensification of change, disembedding of social institutions, growth in reflexivity, changes in consumption, demographic shifts (including migration), production of ecological hazards and risks: in this period of 'high modernity' or 'late capitalism', there are two major challenges for social anthropology. One is to seek to discover what global processes mean at the local level and how people understand and respond to them; the other is to devise theories and methods which enable us to research and analyse them. This programme attempts to address both of these aims.

Social science is not lacking in theories of modernisation, notably by sociologists. But their work rarely engages with the local, and even more rarely with societies outside of the confines of the West, even though such theories are often presented as applying universally. The programme of research proposed here would seek to marry theoretical debates with ethnographic data from a location in which I have been working for over three decades, namely a village on Mafia Island, Tanzania.

The major focus will be upon food as a dominant vehicle of and metaphor for modernity. The study of food involves various domains of anthropology: symbolic, economic and political. It also relates to public understandings of science and technology, to concepts of rationality, risk and

responsibility, to lay or indigenous forms of knowledge and to notions of identity. The aim is a) to consider the extent to which change is perceived to be accelerating and in what areas b) to elicit people's explanations for such changes as well as their views on where they and their communities are heading in future. It will build upon my recent work on food (Caplan 1997b) and risk (Caplan 2000), as well as upon earlier work, including collaborative, dialogic work on personal narratives (Caplan 1997a).

b) 'Hard times' (maisha magumu): local understandings of the impact of recent global processes on food security and insecurity on Mafia Island, Tanzania.

Since my last visit in 1994, Tanzania has continued to struggle with economic problems (including the burden of debt and the implications of structural adjustment programmes), with resultant cutbacks in welfare provision and exacerbation of problems of food security.

The effects of all of these changes need to be assessed at the local, as well as the national level. Mafia Island, which has a long history of food security problems, has been badly affected and it appears from letters received that for most villagers the quality of life, already deteriorating at the time of my fieldwork in 1985 and 1994, has declined still further. How do people interpret this situation? Where do they place responsibility for it? What strategies do they adopt to cope, and what view do they have of the future? Is the major risk indeed perceived to be food security, or are there other issues (such as the growing menace of AIDS)?

Building upon work already carried out, further data would be sought on people's own conceptualisations of processes beyond the local. Who are considered to be the decision-makers around issues such as food production and consumption, sale of cash crops, and bought food and its prices, and on what basis are decisions made? How much room for manoeuvre – agency - do villagers themselves have? How do they interpret the dramatic changes in official rhetoric and policy from the days of *ujamaa* ('African socialism') to the current emphasis on neo-liberalism? How do views and explanations differ by social location, particularly age and gender?

c) Methodology

The major methods used would be as follows

- i) at the village level: semi-structured and informal interviews and discussions with villagers and participant observation
- ii) at the District (island) level: investigation of records at the district office and interviews with government officials, especially agricultural officers
- iii) at the national level: interviews with as many as possible of the following:
 - officials at the Ministry responsible for food
 - staff at the Tanzania Food and Nutrition Centre
 - discussion with colleagues at the University of Dar es Salaam, especially the Rural Food Security Programme
 - discussion with officials of NGOs based in the capital e.g. UNICEF

d) User engagement and communication plans.

I see this research as having potential value for users both within and outside of the research community, including the following categories:

- subjects of research for whom it will act as catalyst for further reflection on their own understandings of social processes and decisions on how to cope with them
- local and national government officials, and local and international NGOs and voluntary organisations, for whom it can contribute to policy formation

In 1994, as well as writing a 38-page report for Utafiti (see Caplan 1995b), I also gave a lecture to assembled notables of the District in the Kilindoni (*Maana ya Maendeleo ni Nini?*): this was later reproduced and copies distributed locally. This time communication plans include reports on fieldwork made available to local people (including translation where needed), public lectures or debates, newspaper articles, radio broadcasts.

5. Some questions to be posed

a) *General questions which inform this research:*

- What is the meaning of 'progress' or 'development'?
- To what extent has change accelerated in the recent past?
- What do people understand by modernization and globalization?
- What processes of modernization are considered particularly significant for them and their communities?
- What do people consider to be the major risks in their lives?
- How do they consider the present compares with the past?
- What kind of future do people envisage?
- Why is the standard of living deteriorating for many?
- If the economy is changing so rapidly, how can people make a living? In particular, how can people obtain sufficient food of good quality?
- Where are decisions made in this regard? what do people consider to be the loci of power? do they trust them?
- Who are the 'experts'? to whom do people turn for advice in matters of food?
- What are considered to be the role and responsibility of the state (national and local), of NGOs, of industrial and commercial enterprises?
- What are people's perceived entitlements, especially in relation to food, and how may they obtain them?
- What are the gender and generational differences in understanding of these issues?

b) *Examples of specific questions to be addressed to participants*

- What global processes do people think have impinged on Mafia Island? How is 'development' perceived? What forms of development have taken place?
- To what extent are people aware of structural adjustment programmes? What effects do they consider these have had?
- What do people consider are the major risks in their lives today? How does food insecurity compare with other major risks (e.g. AIDS and other health risks, economic insecurity)?
- How do people explain increasing food insecurity? How does it link to other issues? What categories of people are particularly vulnerable (e.g. women, children)?
- What do people consider to be the role of the state in guaranteeing food entitlements? Is there a conception of people's entitlements as citizens?
- From where does bought food originate and what do people know of how it got there? How do people understand pricing mechanisms?
- To what extent do people consider the way food is grown is subject to state controls or inputs? Are there other external constraints on production?
- To what extent are people aware of other kinds of foods than those they produce themselves or buy in the village shops? Are such foods considered desirable?
- How useful do people consider the role of local, national and international NGOs to be?

Appendix 2: Interviews conducted in Tanzania June-August 2002

1. Dar es Salaam:

a) *University*

Professor Chachage Chachage

Dr. Simeon Mesaki

Professor Marjorie Mbilinyi: Rural Food Security and KIHACHA

b) *Government Departments and Non-governmental Organisations*

Bertha Mlay – UNICEF

Yefred Myenzi – Hajki ya Ardhi Institute

Dr. Wilbald Lorri - Tanzania Food and Nutrition Centre

Jeremiah Daffa – Tanzania Coastal Management Partnership

James Onazi – FAO

Mrs. Kaduna – Ministry of Agriculture and Food Security

Gregory Njau – ENATA (re proposed Prawn Farm on Mafia)

c) *Mafia People in DSM*

Dr Ramadhani Dau

Mjohi Bakari - Chuo cha Bandari

Chamama DSM Committee

2. Mafia Island

a) Kilindoni

Government officials:

District Commissioner – Mr. Alli Libaba

Mkurugenzi/DED – Mr. Gwakirayi

Officials in offices of

Ardhi, Biashara, Elimu, Kilimo, Maendeleo, Mchumi na Mipango,

Ushirika

MP and Political Parties:

Mohammedali Mpala – MP's Office

Abdillahi Mihewa – CCM

NGOs:

Chamama – Mikidadi Juma Kichange, Mikidadi Ahmed

MICAS – Dr. Ahmed Ahmed

Tasisi ya Dini – Padre Benno Kikudo

Kimama – Mama Shirazi

Hospital

Dr. Naomi Khatibu Manzi

Dr. Bhai

Nurse Mwanajuma Ismael

Other

Felix de Sousa – TANPESCA

b) *Chole/Utende*

George Msumi Director, MIMP

Thomas Chale – micro-credit project, MIMP

Jasons Rubens – Technical Advisor, WWF

Catherine Muir – Turtle and Dugong Conservation Project

Katia Palazzo – Co-owner, Polepole Bungalow Resort

Maura Cavalla – Manager, Kinasi Hotel
Peter Byrnes – Owner, Kinasi Hotel
Jean de Villiers –Co-owner, Chole Mjini Hotel
Ann de Villiers – Co-owner, Chole Mjini Hotel and Chole dvelopment projects
Alan Stafford, Manager, Chole Mjini Hotel
Karen Oakes – trainer of kindergarten teachers, Chole Island
Emmanuel Nalaila – deputy manager, Mafia Island Lodge

c) Kanga Village

In accordance with normal anthropological practice, and to comply with undertakings of confidentiality and anonymity given to villagers, I have not listed people here by name. I interviewed or held conversations at least once with over 50 villagers, covering a wide range of age, occupations and gender:

Village officials
Teachers
Health workers
Elders, women, young people
Traditional healers
Fishermen
Traders
Women's groups
Secondary school leavers
Religious leaders
Leaders of political parties

Appendix 3. District Hospital Kilindoni: Staffing

Medical records – 1 out of 4 needed
 Dental – 1 out of 4
 Senior Doctors – 1 out of 2
 Anaesthetist – 0 out of 2
 AMO Ophthalmology – 0 out of 1
 AMO Psychiatrist – 0 out of 1
 AMO Radiology – 0 out of 1
 Clinical officers/medical assistants – 2 out of 13
 Nursing Officer – 3 out of 10
 Public Health nurse A - 0 out of 1
 Public Health nurse B – 1 out of 5
 Nurse/midwife – 4 out of 33
 Pharmacist – 0 out of 1
 Assistant Pharmacist – 1 out of 1
 Medical Attendant pharmacy – 1 out of 1
 Lab technician – 0 out of 1
 Assistant lab technician – 2 out of 2
 Lab attendant – 0 out of 2
 Environmental health education – 2 out of 3
 Radiographer – 0 out of 1
 Assistant Radiographer – 0 out of 1
 Medical Attendant – 1 out of 1

Appendix 4: Video: Life on Mafia Island, Tanzania (English 50 mins) Maisha ya Watu Mafia, Tanzania (Swahili version (70 mins))

Photographer – Pat Caplan
 Editor – Carrie Clanton
 Funding – Nuffield Foundation
 Production facilities – Department of Anthropology, Goldsmiths College

Contents

- Getting to Mafia
- Locating Mafia in History: the old capital on Chole, today's capital Kilindoni
- Going to Kanga village
- Houses and household activities: building and repairing houses, preparing food and fetching water
- Making a living: cultivation, fishing, trade (shops and tea-houses), making mats
- Getting an education: the primary school and a Koran school
- Health and illness: how the *zahanati* works, trance healing rituals (*kupunga shaitani*)
- Leisure and pleasure: football, other ball games, playing *bao*, dancing
- A village wedding
- The Mafia Island Marine Park competition for schoolchildren
- Farewell to Mafia